# A Guide to the Massachusetts Public Records Law



Published by William Francis Galvin Secretary of the Commonwealth Division of Public Records

Updated January 2017

www.sec.state.ma.us/pre/prepdf/guide.pdf



The founding fathers of our nation strove to develop an open government formed on the principles of democracy and public participation. An informed citizen is better equipped to participate in that process.

Laws mandating the disclosure of public records have existed in the Commonwealth of Massachusetts since 1851. The federal Freedom of Information Act was signed into law in 1966 by President Lyndon B. Johnson. In 1974, Congress amended the

federal Freedom of Information Act in order to make government records more accessible to the public.

The Massachusetts Public Records Law parallels federal law, with some variation. Every government record in Massachusetts is presumed to be public unless it may be withheld under a specifically stated exemption.

As Secretary of the Commonwealth and chief public information officer for the Commonwealth, I am pleased to publish this guide explaining the Public Records Law. The full text of the law is provided, as well as a brief description of each of the exemptions to the law.

Also included is a section of frequently asked questions about a requester's right to access public records, as well as a government records custodian's duty to respond to those requests.

Any additional questions regarding the Public Records Law should be directed to the Division of Public Records at (617) 727-2832 during regular business hours.

You may access Division of Public Records publications and other information at <a href="https://www.sec.state.ma.us/pre/preidx.htm">www.sec.state.ma.us/pre/preidx.htm</a>.

William Francis Galvin
Secretary of the Commonwealth

William Travin Galein

## Table of Contents

Frequently Asked Questions	1
Overview	
Exemptions to the Public Records Law	
Records Management	34
Appendix	40
Applicable Statutes	40
Public Records Access Regulations	53
Examples of Exemption (a) Statutes	74



Published by William Francis Galvin Secretary of the Commonwealth

Division of Public Records One Ashburton Place, Room 1719 Boston, MA 02108

Telephone: (617) 727-2832

Fax: (617) 727-5914

Email: <a href="mailto:pre@sec.state.ma.us">pre@sec.state.ma.us</a>

www.sec.state.ma.us/pre/preidx.htm

## **Frequently Asked Questions**

What is the difference between the federal Freedom of Information Act and the Massachusetts Public Records Law?

The federal Freedom of Information Act is a statute that applies to federal records. The Massachusetts Public Records Law applies to records created by or in the custody of a state or local agency, board or other government entity.

#### Who can help me with questions regarding the Public Records Law?

The Division of Public Records (Division) has always provided an "attorney of the day" to assist any person seeking information regarding the Public Records Law.

The hours of operation for the Division are Monday-Friday, with the exception of holidays, from 8:45 a.m. to 5:00 p.m. The telephone number for the Division is (617) 727-2832, and the email address is pre@sec.state.ma.us.

#### What is a "public record"

Every record that is made or received by a government entity or employee is presumed to be a public record unless a specific statutory exemption permits or requires it to be withheld in whole or in part.

Specific statutory exemptions have been created by the legislature. There are non-statutory exemptions as well called common law exemptions. Non-statutory exemptions include the common law attorney client privilege and the work product privilege. These exemptions permit the agency or municipality to withhold a record from the public. A records access officer (RAO) must prove with specificity why it should be allowed to withhold any public record.

The exemptions to the Public Records Law are described in this guide. If an RAO claims an exemption and withholds a record, the RAO has the burden of showing how the exemption applies to the record and why it should be withheld.

#### How do I find the records I seek?

A person seeking access to government records must obtain them from the government office that created or received the records.

#### Does the Division of Public Records have my records?

The Division of Public Records (Division) is not a warehouse for government records. The only records kept in the Division are those that are essential to the business operations of the Division.

To obtain public records a person must directly contact the municipal or state agency office that is the custodian of the sought for records.

#### Does the Public Records Law apply to court, legislative or federal records?

The Public Records Law does not apply to records held by federal agencies, the legislature or the courts of the Commonwealth. Accordingly, the Supervisor is unable to assist requesters seeking such records.

#### What is a Records Access Officer?

A Records Access Officer (RAO) is the person responsible for responding to requests for public records. Information on how to contact an RAO is usually available on the website for the applicable municipal or state entity holding the records sought by requesters.

#### What is a records custodian?

A records custodian means any governmental entity that makes or receives public records.

#### How do I obtain copies of public records?

To obtain a copy of a record, you must make a request to the RAO for the municipal or state agency that you believe has records you are seeking.

#### What do I do if my request is denied?

An RAO must respond to your request as determined by the Public Records Law. If the RAO fails to respond or denies a request, a requester may appeal the matter to the Supervisor within ninety days.

Under the Public Records Regulations, all appeals to the Supervisor must include a copy of the original request, any response by the RAO and a statement indicating the reason for the appeal. The requester must also provide a copy of the appeal petition to the RAO.

#### May I also go to court to seek public records?

A requester may also commence a civil action in superior court to enforce the requirements of the Public Records Law. Where applicable, the superior court may award reasonable attorney's fees and costs in cases where the requestor obtains relief.

## My appeal was closed because I did not provide the necessary information. What do I do now?

The Supervisor will close an appeal without a finding if a requester fails to provide a copy of the request or the response. The Supervisor will close an appeal without a finding if the requester fails to provide a copy of the request to the RAO, or fails to provide a copy of the petition for appeal to the RAO.

In such cases, a requester may seek a new appeal, provided the appeal is filed in compliance with the Public Records Regulations.

## What are the requirements for an RAO response to a public records request?

An RAO's response must be in writing, and must provide the name of the RAO. The response must include a good faith estimate of any cost of providing the record.

The response must also include a specific exemption to the Public Records Law to justify the denial of access to any record, and an explanation of how that exemption applies to the records. Any denial must include instructions on how to appeal to the Supervisor of Records.

#### Must my request be in writing, and do I need to use a specific form?

A written request is not required but is strongly recommended. An oral request made in person is permitted. An RAO is not permitted to require a written request, but may write an oral request on its own form to assist in prompt response.

To appeal an RAO response to the Supervisor, however, a request must be in writing.

#### May I appeal a failure to answer a question?

The Public Records Law only applies to records. An RAO is not required by the Public Records Law to answer questions or create a record in response to a request; however, an RAO must provide any records that exist that respond to a question.

#### What is the cost for copies of public records; what about electronic records?

Absent a specifically identified statute or regulation, an RAO may charge no more than \$0.05 per page for single and double-sided black and white paper copies or computer printouts. There is no longer a separate charge for police or fire reports, or for computer printouts.

#### 4 • A Guide to the Massachusetts Public Records Law

The Public Records Law and its Regulations apply to all Massachusetts government records, regardless of form, and regardless of the location of the records.

Provision of public records in electronic form is preferred where available. An RAO is not permitted to assess a copying fee for electronic records. The \$0.05 fee applies only to paper copies of records.

#### Is an RAO required to provide a fee estimate?

The Public Records Regulations require that an RAO provide a detailed, written, good faith estimate for the cost of complying with a public record request.

The fee estimate must contain a statement advising the requester that the actual cost of producing the record might vary once the agency or municipality begins preparing the record. An agency or municipality is permitted to require payment of the estimated fee before commencing work.

All agencies and municipalities are strongly urged to waive the fees associated with access to public records, but are not required to do so under the law.

Public records that are of great interest to a large number of people must be readily available within the office of the RAO and should be provided at a minimum cost, if any. Examples include minutes of board meetings, town meeting documents, warrants, street lists and municipal financial documents. Many of these records are required to be placed on the RAO's website.

#### May the RAO charge a fee for search and segregation of records?

An RAO may charge and recover a fee for the time spent searching, redacting, photocopying and refiling a record. Agencies shall not assess a fee for the first four hours of time spent searching for, compiling, segregating, redacting and reproducing a requested record. Municipalities with a population of over 20,000 shall not assess a fee for the first two hours of time spent searching for, compiling, segregating, redacting and reproducing a requested record. Municipalities with a population of 20,000 and under are permitted to charge for the first two hours of time spent searching for, compiling, segregating, redacting and reproducing a requested record.

The hourly rate may not be greater than the prorated hourly wage of the lowest paid employee who is capable of performing the task. Generally, an RAO is not permitted to charge an hourly rate in excess of \$25.00 per hour to search for records. Municipal RAOs may petition the Supervisor for permission to charge a fee in excess of \$25.00.

The fee estimate must provide the hourly rate and the number of hours required for each portion of the task. An RAO may not recover fees associated with record organization.

Agency and municipal RAOs may petition the Supervisor for permission to assess a fee for time spent segregating and redacting.

If a requestor wishes to review records in the records custodian's office but does not require copies, a records custodian may charge and recover a fee for his or her time spent searching for and redacting the records. Access to records viewed in this manner cannot be denied and only minor fees associated with securing the record should be charged.

#### When must minutes of an open meeting be made available to the public?

The Open Meeting Law, applicable to public bodies such as select boards for towns, is enforced by the Office of the Attorney General, Division of Open Government. Any questions regarding the content of minutes, requirements to keep minutes or any procedural aspects of the Open Meeting Law should be addressed to the Division of Open Government.

Minutes of open meetings, regardless of form, are public and must be made available in a timely fashion.

There is no requirement that the minutes be transcribed or approved before they are made public. An RAO should clearly mark all such minutes "unofficial."

Pursuant to the Open Meeting Law, minutes of prior open meetings, regardless of form, must be reviewed and accepted promptly. Copies of the minutes of all open meetings should be readily available. Many public bodies are required to post minutes to meetings on the public body's website. RAOs are strongly encouraged to waive all fees associated with the minutes of open meetings.

Minutes of executive session meetings must be reviewed and released regularly and promptly. Executive session minutes must be released to the public as soon as the stated purpose for the executive session protection has ceased.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> G. L. c. 30A, §§ 18-25.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> www.mass.gov/ago/bureaus/government/the-division-of-open-government/.

## Does a requester have greater right of access to records if he is the subject of a record?

Under the Public Records Law, every requester is treated equally; therefore, even a person who is the subject of the record is not granted any greater access right than any other person.

Some statutes and regulations allow requesters to obtain records in a manner that does not require a request under the Public Records Law. It should be noted that once a record is deemed public it may be obtained by anyone upon request.

A list of statutes limiting access to public records is found in the back of this book. This list includes student records, criminal offender record information, and other records the access to which is limited by law.

## Is a requester required to disclose the intended use of the public record requested?

With the possible exception of situations where the RAO is anticipating the withholding of records pursuant to Exemption (n) of the Public Records Law, determining whether the records are being requested for a commercial purpose, or determining whether to grant a fee waiver, a records custodian may not ask a requester the reason for the request or the intended use of the requested records.<sup>3</sup>

#### How should an RAO respond to an unclear request?

RAOs must help the requester to determine the precise record or records responsive to a request; however, a requester must provide a reasonable description of the requested records. If a request is unclear the RAO is expected to seek clarification from the requester.

## What if a records custodian claims that it is not subject to the Public Records Law?

The Public Records Law only applies to Massachusetts governmental entities. The burden lies with the entity to show that the Public Records Law does not apply.

#### Are RAOs required to forward a request for records not in their possession?

RAOs must use their knowledge of the records to ensure that a request for records is delivered to the appropriate party. A large public records request may include items for which the RAO is not directly responsible, as it may

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> G. L. c. 4, § 7(26)(n); 950 C.M.R. 32.06(2)(h).

include a request for records of another division or department of the RAOs' agency or municipality. An RAO is expected to forward such requests to the appropriate parties in responding to a public records request, and inform the requester he or she has done so.

#### **Overview**

The Massachusetts Public Records Law (Public Records Law) and its Regulations provide that each person has a right of access to public information. This right of access includes the right to inspect, copy or have copies of records provided upon the payment of a reasonable fee.

The Public Records Law broadly define "public records" to include "all books, papers, maps, photographs, recorded tapes, financial statements, statistical tabulations, or other documentary materials or data, regardless of physical form or characteristics, made or received by any officer or employee" of any Massachusetts governmental entity. 6

There are strictly and narrowly construed exemptions and common law privileges to the broad definition of "public records." This guide will briefly review the application of these exemptions as well as explore some of the other issues that arise when a request is made for access to government records.

#### Updated Public Records Law

The Public Records Law and its Regulations were updated with changes effective January 1, 2017. Among other things, the updated law sets limits on fees, provides deadlines for the provision of records, and requires the designation of a "Records Access Officer." The updated law also distinguishes between "agencies" and "municipalities" and assigns certain duties to each entity.

The Regulations define "agency" as the following:

Any agency, executive office, department, board, commission, bureau, division or authority of the commonwealth that is identified in M.G.L. c. 66, § 6A and c. 4, § 7, clause Twenty-sixth and makes or receives "public records", as defined in 950 CMR 32.02. <u>Agency</u> includes any person, corporation, association, partnership or other legal entity which receives or expends public

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> G. L. c. 66, § 10(a).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Id; 950 C.M.R. 32.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> G. L. c. 4, § 7(26).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> G. L. c. 4, § 7(26); see also Attorney General v. Assistant Commissioner of the Real Property Department of Boston, 380 Mass. 623, 625 (1980) (the statutory exemptions are to be strictly and narrowly construed).

funds for the payment or administration of pensions for any current or former employees of the commonwealth or any political subdivision as defined in M.G.L. c. 32, § 1.8

The Regulations define "municipality" as the following:

Cities and towns, local housing, redevelopment or similar authorities. A consortium, consolidation or combination of entities within a single political subdivision of the commonwealth or among multiple political subdivisions of the commonwealth shall be deemed a municipality. 9

A "Records Access Officer" (RAO) is an employee of a governmental records custodian. An RAO is the employee designated within a governmental entity to perform certain duties, including coordinating a response to requests for access to public records, assisting individuals seeking public records in identifying the records requested, and preparing guidelines that enable requesters to make informed requests regarding the availability of such public records electronically or otherwise. <sup>10</sup>

#### The Request

There are no strict rules that govern the manner in which requests for public information should be made. Requests may be made in person or in writing. Written requests may be made in person, by mail, facsimile or email. An RAO must provide information on her custodian's website with respect to requests for public records.

A requester must provide the RAO with a reasonable description of the desired information. 12

## The Response

The RAO must respond to requests without unreasonable delay and within ten business days. <sup>13</sup> The RAO may offer to provide records; provide a fee estimate, where applicable; or deny access to records in a manner consistent with G. L. c. 66, § 10(a-b). <sup>14</sup>

A denial must detail the specific basis for withholding the requested materials. <sup>15</sup> The denial must include a citation to one of the statutory or

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> 950 C.M.R. 32.02

<sup>9</sup> <u>Id</u>.

<sup>10</sup> <u>Id</u>.

<sup>11</sup> 950 CMR 32.06(1)(c).

<sup>12</sup> 950 CMR 32.06(1)(b).

<sup>13</sup> G. L. c. 66, § 10(a-b); 950 CMR 32.06(2)(a).

<sup>14</sup> <u>Id</u>.

<sup>15</sup> G. L. c. 66, § 10(a-b).

common law exemptions upon which the RAO relies, and must explain why the exemption applies. <sup>16</sup>

A denial must also advise the requester of the right to seek redress through the administrative process provided by the Supervisor of Records (Supervisor) as well as the judicial remedy available in superior court.<sup>17</sup>

The mandatory disclosure provision of the Public Records Law only applies to information that is in the custody of the governmental entity at the time the request is received. <sup>18</sup> Consequently, there is no obligation to create a record for a requester or to honor prospective requests. It should be noted, however, that the Regulations do not prohibit an RAO from responding to such requests.

Information contained in a database is presumed to exist at the time of the request. Provision of an extract of requested data does not constitute creation of a public record. An RAO may not deny a request for data contained in such a database on the theory that extraction results in creating a new record. To do so would deny access to information that does exist at the time of the request, though not in a form easily accessible by the requester.

All requests for public records must be honored in accordance with the Public Records Law. With the exception of situations in which an RAO is determining whether the records are being requested for a commercial purpose, whether to grant a fee waiver, or the applicability of Exemption (n), an RAO may not ask a requester the reason for the request or the intended use of the requested records. Inquiries by an RAO into a requester's status or motivation for seeking information are prohibited.<sup>19</sup>

#### **Fees**

An RAO may charge a reasonable fee to recover the costs of complying with a public records request.<sup>20</sup> An RAO is encouraged, but not required, to waive fees where disclosure is in the public interest.<sup>21</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> Id

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> 950 CMR 32.06(3)(c).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> G. L. c. 4, § 7(26) (defining "public records" as materials which have already been "made or received" by a public entity); <u>see also</u> 32 Op. Att'y Gen. 157, 165 (May 18, 1977) (custodian is not obliged to create a record in response to a request for information).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> See G. L. c. 66, § 10(a) (public records are to be provided to "any person"); but see G. L. c. 4, § 7(26)(n) (a records custodian may ask the requester to voluntarily provide additional information in order to reach a "reasonable judgment" regarding disclosure of responsive records); 950 CMR 32.06(2)(h).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> G. L. c. 66, § 10(a); see also 950 CMR 32.07.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> 950 CMR 32.07(2)(k).

The Supervisor does not have the authority to order a waiver of reasonable fees. An RAO assessing a fee must do so in accordance with any applicable statutory provisions, the Regulations or an enabling provision. <sup>22</sup>

The updated Public Records Law and its Regulations provide for the following with respect to fees to access public records:

#### Fees for segregating and redacting

An agency or municipality shall not assess a fee for time spent segregating and redacting a requested record unless such segregation or redaction is required by law or approved by the Supervisor of Records through a petition discussed below.<sup>23</sup>

"Segregation time" means the time used to review records to determine what portions are subject to redaction or withholding under M.G.L. c. 4, § 7, clause Twenty-sixth or other legally applicable privileges. Segregation time shall not include time expended to review record for accuracy and correct errors.<sup>24</sup>

"Redact" means to delete, or otherwise expurgate that part of a public record that is exempt from disclosure under M.G.L. c. 4, § 7, clause Twenty-sixth or other legally applicable privileges from non-exempt material.<sup>25</sup>

#### Fees for Copies

In addition to the search and segregation fees, records custodians may charge \$0.05 for either single and double-sided black and white paper copies or printouts.<sup>26</sup> When the request is for materials that are not susceptible to ordinary means of reproduction, such as photographs or computer tapes, the actual cost of reproduction may be assessed to the requester. <sup>27</sup> There are also specific statutes that establish fees for copies of public records. 28

#### Agencies

Agencies may not assess a fee for the first four hours of time spent searching for, compiling, segregating, redacting and reproducing a requested record. Agencies may not assess a fee of more than \$25 per hour for the cost to comply with a request for public records.<sup>29</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> <u>See e.g.</u>, G. L. c. 66, § 10(a); <u>see also</u> 950 CMR 32.07.

<sup>23</sup> G.L. c. 66, §10(d); 950 CMR 32.07(2)(d).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> 950 CMR 32.02.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> Id.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> 950 CMR 32.07(2)(e).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> 950 CMR 32.07(2)(h).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> <u>See e.g.</u>, G. L. c. 262, § 38 (copies of records at the Registry of Deeds). <sup>29</sup> 950 CMR 32.07(2)(1).

#### Municipalities

Municipalities with a population of over 20,000 may not assess a fee for the first two hours of time spent searching for, compiling, segregating, redacting and reproducing a requested record. Municipalities with a population of 20,000 and under may assess a fee, including the first two hours, for time spent searching for, compiling, segregating, redacting and reproducing a requested record.<sup>30</sup>

Population data shall be determined by the decennial US. Census and it shall be the burden of the RAO to provide population data information when responding to a request.<sup>31</sup>

A municipal records access officer may not assess a fee of more than \$25 per hour for the cost to comply with a request for public records unless approved by the Supervisor through a petition discussed below.<sup>32</sup>

#### **RAO Petitions**

Under the updated Public Records Law and Regulations, RAOs may request an extension from the Supervisor of Records if more time is needed to provide records. Such a request for extension must occur within 20 business days of receipt of request or within 10 business days after receipt of a determination by the Supervisor of Records that the requested record constitutes a public record. The Supervisor may grant an extension of 20 business days to an agency and 30 business days to a municipality, or longer depending on the circumstances.<sup>33</sup>

RAOs may also petition the Supervisor of Records to charge for time spent segregating or redacting records. Only a municipal RAO may petition the Supervisor for permission to charge fees in excess of the maximum hourly rate of \$25 per hour for time required to comply with a request.<sup>34</sup>

Filing a petition does not affect the requirement that an RAO shall provide an initial response to a requester within ten business days after receipt of a request for public records.<sup>35</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> 950 CMR 32.07(2)(m).

<sup>31 &</sup>lt;u>Id</u>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> <u>Id</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> 950 CMR 32.06(4)(e).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> 950 CMR 32.06(4)(h).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> 950 CMR 32.06(4)(b).

#### **Agency RAO reporting requirement**

Agency RAOs are required to report to the Secretary certain information pertaining to requests for public records. This information includes, among other things, the nature of the request, the date of the request and response, the amount of fees assessed, and information regarding the use of administrative and judicial remedies.<sup>36</sup>

Agency RAOs must report this information by using an online form provided on the Secretary's website. This website will serve as the form prescribed by the Secretary to accomplish this task as required by G.L. c. 66 § 6A(e). Agency RAOs may complete the online form using the following link: www.sec.state.ma.us/AgencyRAOWeb/RAOAccounts/Welcome.aspx.

The public may search the Agency Public Records Request Database website at: <a href="https://www.sec.state.ma.us/RequestSearchWeb/Webpages/Welcome.aspx">www.sec.state.ma.us/RequestSearchWeb/Webpages/Welcome.aspx</a>.

## **Exemptions to the Public Records Law**

The statutory definition of "public records" contains exemptions providing the basis for withholding records completely or in part.<sup>37</sup> The exemptions are strictly and narrowly construed.<sup>38</sup> Where exempt information is intertwined with non-exempt information, the non-exempt portions are subject to disclosure once the exempt portions are deleted.<sup>39</sup> A review of the appropriate applications of the exemptions follows.

## Exemption (a) – The Statutory Exemption

Exemption (a) applies to records that are:

specifically or by necessary implication exempted from disclosure by statute <sup>40</sup>

A government entity may use the statutory exemption as a basis for withholding requested materials where the exempting statute expressly states or necessarily implies that the public's right to inspect records under the Public Records Law is restricted.<sup>41</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> G.L. c. 66, § 6A(e).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> G. L. c. 4, § 7(26).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> Attorney General v. Assistant Commissioner of the Real Property Department of Boston, 380 Mass. 623, 625 (1980).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> G. L. c. 66, § 10(a); Reinstein v. Police Commissioner of Boston, 378 Mass. 281, 289-90 (1979) (the statutory exemptions are not blanket in nature).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup> G. L. c. 4, § 7(26)(a).

Attorney General v. Collector of Lynn, 377 Mass. 151, 154 (1979); Ottaway Newspapers, Inc. v. Appeals Court, 372 Mass. 539, 545-46 (1977).

This exemption creates two categories of exempt records. The first category includes records that are specifically exempt from disclosure by statute. Such statutes expressly state that such a record either "shall not be a public record," "shall be kept confidential" or "shall not be subject to the disclosure provision of the Public Records Law."

The second category under the exemption includes records deemed exempt under statute by necessary implication. <sup>43</sup> Such statutes expressly limit the dissemination of particular records to a defined group of individuals or entities. <sup>44</sup> A statute is not a basis for exemption if it merely lists individuals or entities to whom the records are to be provided; the statute must expressly limit access to the listed individuals or entities.

*For example:* I seek a copy of an arrest report. May this report be withheld by the records custodian pursuant to Exemption (a) as Criminal Offender Record Information (C.O.R.I.)?

A record that is recorded as a result of the initiation of criminal proceedings or other consequent proceeding may be withheld under the C.O.R.I. statute. <sup>45</sup> The Department of Criminal Justice Information Services, conferred with the authority to promulgate and interpret statutes and regulations regarding C.O.R.I., interprets the "initiation of criminal proceedings" to be "the point when a criminal investigation is sufficiently complete that the investigating officers take actions toward bringing a specific suspect to court."<sup>46</sup>

Please reference the Appendix of this Guide for other examples of statutes that specifically exempt records from disclosure.

## Exemption (b)

Exemption (b) applies to records that are:

related solely to internal personnel rules and practices of the government unit, provided however, that such records shall be withheld only to the extent that proper performance of necessary governmental functions requires such withholding <sup>47</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup> <u>See</u>, <u>e.g.</u>, G. L. c. 41, § 97D (all reports of rape or sexual assault "shall not be public reports").

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>43</sup> G. L. c. 4, § 7(26)(a).

<sup>44</sup> See, e.g., G. L. c. 6, § 172 ("Criminal offender record information ... shall only be disseminated to: criminal justice agencies....").

<sup>45</sup> See 803 C.M.R. 7 (C.O.R.I. may be released at the discretion of law enforcement if disclosure aids investigative efforts).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>46</sup> G. L. c. 6, § 168.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>47</sup> G. L. c. 4, § 7(26)(b).

There are no authoritative Massachusetts decisions interpreting Exemption (b). The general purpose of the cognate federal exemption, however, is to relieve agencies of the burden of assembling and maintaining for public inspection matters in which the public cannot reasonably be expected to have a legitimate interest. 48

The language of the federal provision is duplicated in the first clause of Exemption (b). The addition of the qualifying second clause of Exemption (b) evidences a legislative intent to create an exemption that is narrower in scope than the previously enacted, parallel federal exemption.<sup>49</sup>

For Exemption (b) to apply in Massachusetts, a records custodian must demonstrate not only that the records relate solely to the internal personnel practices of the government entity, but also that proper performance of necessary government functions will be inhibited by disclosure.

*For example:* Are all Department of Correction (DOC) security policies and procedures public?

One of the DOC's primary functions is to maintain secure penal institutions. Information regarding the procedures used by correctional officers during law enforcement efforts relates solely to the internal workings of the DOC. Moreover, disclosure of this information could prove detrimental to the DOC's law enforcement efforts, as knowledge of the DOC's security response procedures could enable an inmate to circumvent such procedures. Accordingly, Exemption (b) will allow the DOC to withhold portions of the requested policies.

### **Exemption (c) – The Privacy Exemption**

Exemption (c), the privacy exemption, is the most frequently invoked exemption. The language of the exemption limits its application to:

personnel and medical files or information; also any other materials or data relating to a specifically named individual, the disclosure of which may constitute an unwarranted invasion of personal privacy<sup>50</sup>

.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>48</sup> Department of the Air Force v. Rose, 425 U.S. 352, 362-70 (1976).

<sup>49</sup> See Globe Newspaper Company v. Boston Retirement Board, 388 Mass. 427, 432-33 (1983) (where the language of a parallel state statute differs in material respects from a previously enacted federal statute, a rejection or expansion of the legal principles embodied in the federal statute may be inferred).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>50</sup> G. L. c. 4, § 7(26)(c).

The privacy exemption is made up of two separate clauses, the first of which exempts personnel and medical files. As a general rule, medical information will always be of a sufficiently personal nature to warrant exemption.<sup>51</sup>

The Massachusetts Supreme Judicial Court determined that exempting personnel information from disclosure serves to protect the government's ability to function effectively as an employer. <sup>52</sup> The release of certain personnel information could disrupt the government's capability to conduct sensitive and careful investigations regarding employees. <sup>53</sup>

While statutorily exempting personnel information from the expansive definition of public records, the legislature did not explicitly define personnel information.<sup>54</sup> However, judicial decisions acknowledge that the term is neither rigid, nor exact, and that the determination is case-specific.<sup>55</sup> The custodian's classification of materials as "personnel information" is not conclusive.<sup>56</sup> Instead, the nature or character of the documents, as opposed to the documents' label, is crucial to the analysis.<sup>57</sup>

The nature of some materials and the context in which they arise take them beyond what the legislature contemplated when exempting personnel information.<sup>58</sup>

Generally, personnel information that is useful in making employment decisions regarding an employee is sufficiently personal to be exempt pursuant to the first clause.<sup>59</sup> Such information may include employment applications, employee work evaluations, disciplinary documentation, and promotion, demotion, or termination information.<sup>60</sup>

<sup>54</sup> G. L. c. 4, § 7(26)(c).

<sup>51</sup> Globe Newspaper Company v. Boston Retirement Board, 388 Mass. 427, 442 (1983); see also Globe Newspaper Company v. Chief Medical Examiner, 404 Mass. 132 (1989) (autopsy reports constitute exempt medical information).

Wakefield Teacher's Association v. School Committee of Wakefield, 431 Mass. 792, 802 (2000).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>53</sup> <u>Id</u>.

Worcester Telegram & Gazette Corporation v. Chief of Police of Worcester, 58 Mass App Ct 1, 5 (2003).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>56</sup> Wakefield Teacher's Association, 431 Mass. at 798.

<sup>57</sup> See Worcester Telegram & Gazette Corp., 436 Mass. at 386.

<sup>58</sup> See Worcester Telegram & Gazette Corp., 58 Mass. App. Ct. at 9.

Wakefield Teachers Association v. School Committee of Wakefield, 431 Mass. 792, 798 (2000); see also Connolly v. Bromery, 15 Mass. App. Ct. 661, 664 (1983) (evaluative materials are of a particularly personal and volatile nature).

Wakefield Teachers Association v. School Committee of Wakefield, 431 Mass. 792, 798 (2000); see also Brogan v. School Committee of Westport, 401 Mass. 306, 308 (1987); Pottle v. School Committee of Braintree, 395 Mass. 861, 866 (1985); George W. Prescott Publishing Company v. Register of Probate for Norfolk County, 395 Mass. 274, 278 (1985).

The Appeals Court of Massachusetts distinguished "personnel records" from "internal affairs" records. The Appeals Court held that materials in a police internal affairs investigation are different in kind from the ordinary evaluations, performance assessments and disciplinary determinations encompassed in the public records exemption for personnel files or information. The Appeals Court held that officers' reports, witness interview summaries, and the internal affairs report itself do not fall within the personnel information exemption, as these documents relate to the workings and determinations of the internal affairs process whose quintessential purpose is to inspire public confidence. 62

Public employees have a diminished expectation of privacy in matters relating to their public employment. <sup>63</sup> Consequently, the public will have greater access to information that relates to an individual's public employment than to the same individual's private activities. <sup>64</sup> For example, an individual's public employment salary is a public record, but the source or amount of private income generally is not public information. <sup>65</sup>

The second clause of the privacy exemption applies to requests for records that implicate privacy interests. Its application is limited to "intimate details of a highly personal nature." Examples of "intimate details of a highly personal nature" include marital status, paternity, substance abuse, government assistance, family disputes and reputation. <sup>67</sup> Portions of records containing such information are exempt unless there is a paramount public interest in disclosure. <sup>68</sup>

When applying the second clause of the exemption to requested records it is necessary to perform a *two-step analysis*: first, determine whether the information constitutes an "intimate detail" and second, determine whether the public interest in disclosure outweighs the privacy interest associated with disclosure. <sup>69</sup> Consequently, the application of the second clause of the exemption must be determined on a case-by-case basis.

*For example:* Can a public employee's employment application and work evaluation be disclosed?

6

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>61</sup> Wakefield Teachers Association v. School Committee of Wakefield, 431 Mass. 792, 799 (2000)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>62</sup> Worcester Telegram & Gazette Corp. v. Chief of Police of Worcester, 58 Mass. App. Ct. 1, 8-9 (2003).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>63</sup> Brogan v. School Committee of Westport, 401 Mass. 306, 308 (1987).

<sup>64</sup> Hastings & Sons Pub. Co. v. City Treasurer of Lynn, 374 Mass. 812, 818 (1978).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>65</sup> Attorney General v. Collector of Lynn, 377 Mass. 151, 156 (1979).

Attorney General v. Assistant Commissioner of the Real Property Department of Boston, 380 Mass. 623, 625 (1980).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>67</sup> I<u>d</u>. at 626 n. 2.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>68</sup> Collector of Lynn, 377 Mass. at 156.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>69</sup> <u>Id</u>

Under the first clause of Exemption (c), certain personnel records may be withheld, therefore, the records custodian may properly withhold certain employment applications and work evaluations under Exemption (c).

Candidates for state employment must provide prospective employers with written disclosure of any relative who is also a state employee. The content of this disclosure is considered public under the Public Records Law.<sup>70</sup>

*For example:* Does Exemption (c) permit resumes of public officials to be withheld from disclosure?

Some of the information contained in a resume may be exempt from disclosure because it relates to a specifically identifiable individual and is the type of information that is useful in making employment decisions. Exemption (c) does not, however, automatically render resumes exempt in their entirety. The statutory exemptions are narrowly construed and are not blanket in nature. The Public Records Law requires a case-by-case analysis of the applicability of its exemptions. Relevant degrees and certifications may be subject to disclosure upon request. Public employees have a diminished expectation of privacy in matters relating to their public employment and the public has a legitimate interest in knowing whether public employees possess the qualifications necessary to perform their jobs.

*For example:* Are settlement agreements exempt under the Public Records Law?

The public interest in the financial information of a public employee outweighs the privacy interest where the financial compensation in question is drawn on an account held by a government entity and comprised of taxpayer funds. Additionally, the disclosure of the settlement amount would assist the public in monitoring government operations. Therefore, exemptions to the Public Records Law will not operate to allow for the withholding of settlement agreements as a whole. However, portions of the agreements, and related responsive records, may be redacted pursuant to specifically-cited exemptions to the Public Records Law.

*For example:* Are the names and addresses of customers of a municipally owned utility public?

The analysis is subjective in nature and requires a balancing of the public's right to know against the relevant privacy interests at stake. The second clause of Exemption (c) applies to "intimate details of a highly personal nature." Names and addresses of residents of Massachusetts over seventeen years of age are not intimate details of a highly personal nature, because they are available in other venues, such as street lists. Since neither the names nor the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>70</sup> See G. L. c. 268A, § 6B.

addresses of the customers are intimate details of a highly personal nature, the balancing test between individual's privacy interests and the public interest in disclosure does not apply.

## **Exemption (d) – The Deliberative Process Exemption**

Exemption (d) provides a limited executive privilege for policy development. It applies to:

inter-agency or intra-agency memoranda or letters relating to policy positions being developed by the agency; but this subclause shall not apply to reasonably completed factual studies or reports on which the development of such policy positions has been or may be based<sup>71</sup>

The exemption is intended to avoid release of materials that could taint the deliberative process if prematurely disclosed. Its application is limited to recommendations on legal and policy matters found within an ongoing deliberative process. Factual reports which are reasonably complete and inferences which can be drawn from factual investigations, even if labeled as opinions or conclusions, are not exempt as deliberative or policy making materials. Only portions of records that possess a deliberative or policymaking character and relate to an ongoing deliberative process are exempt from mandatory disclosure.

*For example:* Is a town's appraisal report, prepared for the purpose of litigation before the Appellate Tax Board, a public record?

Such a report may contain recommendations to the town. As long as the town is still negotiating a settlement, the deliberative process has not been concluded and the report may be withheld under Exemption (d).

## Exemption (e)

Exemption (e) allows the withholding of:

notebooks and other materials prepared by an employee of the commonwealth which are personal to him and not maintained as part of the files of the governmental unit<sup>74</sup>

The application of Exemption (e) is limited to records that are work-related but can be characterized as personal to an employee. Materials covered by the exemption include personal reflections on work-related activities and notes

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>71</sup> G. L. c. 4, § 7(26)(d).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>72</sup> Babets v. Sec'y of the Exec. Office of Human Servs., 403 Mass. 230, 237 n.8 (1988).

Moore-McCormack Lines, Inc. v. I.T.O. Corporation of Baltimore, 508 F.2d 945, 948 (1974) (construing cognate federal provision).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>74</sup> G. L. c. 4, § 7(26)(e).

created by an employee to assist him in preparing reports for other employees or for the files of the governmental entity. The exemption may not be used to withhold any materials that are shared with other employees or are being maintained as part of the files of a governmental unit.<sup>75</sup>

*For example:* A requester sought all documents from a government entity related to a particular issue. The responsive records included personal notes of the government entity's employee. Are these notes public?

Notes are not public if they are personal in nature, kept by the employee merely to assist him in preparing reports, are not shared with anyone in the department and are not maintained as part of the department's files.

*For example:* Are handwritten shorthand notes taken by the secretary of a public body a public record?

Such notes are not personal in nature simply because they contain the secretary's subjective impressions of a board meeting. The notes cannot be considered merely a reference to assist the secretary in fulfilling duties, but rather the notes comprise a government file itself.

Where notes of open meetings have been taken by secretaries, it has been held that the notes are public at the time that they are created. In a sense, the notes are minutes even though not yet approved. Accordingly, Exemption (e) does not provide a basis for withholding of such notes.

### **Exemption (f) - The Investigatory Exemption**

Exemption (f), the investigatory exemption, provides custodians a basis for withholding:

investigatory materials necessarily compiled out of the public view by law enforcement or other investigatory officials the disclosure of which materials would probably so prejudice the possibility of effective law enforcement that such disclosure would not be in the public interest<sup>76</sup>

The exemption allows investigative officials to withhold materials that could compromise investigative efforts if disclosed. Exemption (f) does not, however, create a blanket exemption for all records that investigative officials create or maintain. A records custodian must demonstrate a prejudice to investigative efforts in order to withhold requested materials. Accordingly, a records custodian may withhold any information relating to an ongoing

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>75</sup> G. L. c. 4, § 7(26)(e).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>76</sup> G. L. c. 4, § 7(26)(f).

District Attorney for the Norfolk District v. Flatley, 419 Mass. 507, 512 (1995); WBZ-TV4
 v. District Attorney for the Suffolk District, 408 Mass. 595, 603 (1990).

investigation that could potentially alert suspects to the activities of investigative officials.

Records custodians may withhold confidential investigative techniques indefinitely since their disclosure would prejudice future law enforcement efforts.<sup>78</sup>

The legislature also designed the exemption to allow investigative officials to provide an assurance of confidentiality to private citizens so that they will speak openly about matters under investigation.<sup>79</sup> Any details in witness statements, which if released create a grave risk of directly or indirectly identifying a private citizen who volunteers as a witness are indefinitely exempt.<sup>80</sup>

**For example:** If a requested incident report contains witness statements, can a police department use Exemption (f) to withhold the requested report in its entirety?

Generally, a police incident report may be released to a requester after the records custodian has redacted the exempt portions from the record, such as, medical information and witness statements. A records custodian may be permitted to withhold an entire report if the identity of witnesses is known to the requester. Such a record could not possibly be redacted in a manner to avoid identification of such witnesses.

### **Exemption (g)**

Exemption (g) applies to:

trade secrets or commercial or financial information voluntarily provided to an agency for use in developing governmental policy and upon a promise of confidentiality; but this subclause shall not apply to information submitted as required by law or as a condition of receiving a governmental contract or other benefit<sup>81</sup>

To properly claim Exemption (g), a custodian must meet all six criteria contained in the exemption: (1) trade secrets or commercial or financial information; (2) voluntarily provided to a government entity; (3) for use in developing government policy; (4) upon an assurance of confidentiality; (5) information not submitted by law; and (6) information not submitted as a

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>78</sup> Bougas v. Chief of Police of Lexington, 371 Mass. 59, 62 (1976); see also United States <u>Department of Justice v. Landano</u>, 113 S. Ct. 2014, 2020 (1993) (discussion of confidential sources of information under the federal Freedom of Information Act.).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>79</sup> <u>Bougas</u>, 371 Mass at 62.

<sup>80</sup> Globe Newspaper Co. v. Boston Retirement Bd., 388 Mass. 427, 438 (1983) (explanation of "identifying details" and "grave risk of indirect identification").

<sup>81</sup> G. L. c. 4, § 7(26)(g).

condition of receiving a governmental benefit. Consequently, this exemption does not apply to information that companies provide to the government in connection with a contract bid or in compliance with a filing requirement.<sup>82</sup>

**For example:** Is a Memorandum submitted as an exhibit in a hearing before the Securities Division of the Secretary of the Commonwealth Office a public record?

In this case, the entity did not satisfy all six criteria of Exemption (g). The first criterion was met as the Memorandum contained commercial information. All of the remaining criteria, however, were not met because the Memorandum was not voluntarily submitted, was not provided for use in developing government policy, and was not submitted upon a promise of confidentiality.

#### **Exemption (h)**

Exemption (h) serves to protect the integrity of the bidding processes used by the government to procure goods and services by allowing a records custodian to withhold the proposals of early bidders from other interested parties. <sup>83</sup> The exemption allows government officials to review bids and proposals in an insulated environment, but also provides for public review of all evaluative materials once a decision is reached.

Competitive bidding ensures full publicity of the contract and encourages the guarding of the public welfare. <sup>84</sup> Although the competitive bidding process does not have the advantages of more flexible purchasing policies, the legislature has mandated the process to foster honesty and accountability in government. <sup>85</sup> Specifically, Exemption (h) applies to:

proposals and bids to enter into any contract or agreement until the time for the opening of bids in the case of proposals or bids to be opened publicly, and until the time for the receipt of bids or proposals has expired in all other cases; and inter-agency or intra-agency communications made in connection with an evaluation process for reviewing bids or proposals, prior to a decision to enter into negotiations with or to award a contract to, a particular person<sup>86</sup>

The exemption addresses two types of records held by an awarding authority (records custodian), each with its own time frame. Proposals may be withheld until the time for the receipt of proposals has expired. Bids may be withheld until such time as the bids are publicly opened and read by the awarding

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>82</sup> <u>Id</u>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>83</sup> Datatrol Inc. v. State Purchasing Agent, 379 Mass. 679, 691 (1980) (the purposes of competitive bidding go beyond economy and efficient administration to the prevention of favoritism in the awarding of government contracts).

<sup>84 &</sup>lt;u>Id</u>. at 699.

 $<sup>\</sup>frac{10}{10}$  at 701.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>86</sup> G. L. c. 4, § 7(26)(h).

authority. This allows the proposals of early bidders to be kept in confidence so that subsequent bidders do not gain an unfair advantage, thus, keeping all on equal footing. The limitation on the duration of the exemption provides the public with an opportunity to review the rejected proposals to ensure that taxpayer dollars are wisely spent.

The second clause of the exemption is similar to Exemption (d) in its application.<sup>87</sup> It allows government officials to withhold any inter-agency or intra-agency communications regarding the evaluations of the bids or proposals until the records custodian renders a decision to enter into negotiations with the successful bidder or awards the contract.

*For example:* May the records custodian withhold proposal and bid documents until the records custodian has finalized a contract with the construction company or developer?

The *first clause* of Exemption (h) allows the records custodian to withhold proposals and bids from disclosure until the time for the opening bids or until the time for receipt of proposals has expired. Once that occurs, the proposals and bids no longer fall under the protection of Exemption (h) and can no longer be withheld.

**For example:** May the records custodian withhold any records concerning the evaluations of the bidders and the awarding process, and at what point do the records become public?

The *second clause* of Exemption (h) allows the records custodian to withhold any inter-agency or intra-agency communications that are made in the process of reviewing the bids and proposals, prior to entering into negotiations with or to award the contract to a particular person. The records custodian may withhold the records pursuant to Exemption (h) only until the contract has been awarded. Once a decision has been made to enter into negotiations the records custodian can no longer withhold the records.

### Exemption (i)

The purpose of Exemption (i) is to provide governmental entities engaged in the acquisition of real property, either through a purchase or an eminent domain proceeding, the same degree of confidentiality that is afforded to private parties. The exemption ensures that the government will not be at a bargaining disadvantage by allowing the other party to use the Public Records Law to gain access to an appraisal prior to completion of negotiations or litigation. Exemption (i) applies to:

appraisals of real property acquired or to be acquired until (1) a final

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>87</sup> G. L. c. 4, § 7(26)(d); <u>See also</u> discussion of the application of Exemption (d) in the Massachusetts Guide to the Public Records Law.

agreement is entered into; or (2) any litigation relative to such appraisal has been terminated; or (3) the time within which to commence such litigation has expired<sup>88</sup>

Application of Exemption (i) is limited to situations in which a governmental entity is concerned that disclosure of the subject appraisal will compromise its ability to effectively negotiate a fair purchase or sale price for the property. The legislature defined "appraisal" as any written analysis, opinion, or conclusion prepared by a real estate appraiser relating to the nature, quality, value or utility of specified interests in, or aspects of, identified real estate. 89

The language of the statute is clear that the three provisions are alternative rather than requisite conditions. Therefore, once one of the three alternatives has occurred, Exemption (i) will no longer serve as a means to withhold the subject appraisal.

For example: May a housing authority (records custodian) withhold appraisals pursuant to Exemption (i) where the records custodian has entered into a final agreement with the property owner and the property owner has agreed to forgo all possible eminent domain claims against the housing authority?

Once one of the three provisions of the exemption has occurred, Exemption (i) cannot be used to withhold the subject appraisal. In this case, the parties reached a final agreement regarding the property, therefore, the exemption no longer applied and the records custodian could not continue to withhold the appraisals.

For example: Where a requester seeks appraisal documents on a parcel for which a negotiated final settlement has been reached, may the records custodian withhold the appraisals on all the parcels of land being acquired for the project until it reaches final agreement on all the parcels and the litigation on the parcels is finalized?

Exemption (i) is parcel specific and the records custodian is may only withhold an appraisal until an agreement has been reached, litigation relative to the appraisal has been terminated, or the time within which to commence such litigation has expired. In this situation, the appraisal sought by the requester pertained to a parcel that had already been acquired, and the records custodian was ordered to produce the appraisal documents for that specific parcel. <sup>90</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>88</sup> G. L. c. 4, § 7(26)(i).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>89</sup> G. L. c. 112, § 173 (definition of appraisal).

<sup>90</sup> Coleman v. Boston Redevelopment Authority, 61 Mass. App. Ct. 239 (2004).

#### Exemption (j)

Exemption (i) allows records custodians of firearm records to withhold:

the names and addresses of any persons contained in, or referred to in, any applications for any licenses to carry or possess firearms issued pursuant to chapter one hundred and forty or any firearms identification cards issued pursuant to said chapter one hundred and forty and the names and addresses on sales or transfers of any firearms, rifles, shotguns, or machine guns or ammunition therefor, as defined in said chapter one hundred and forty and the names and addresses on said licenses or cards<sup>91</sup>

The purpose of Exemption (i) is to prevent individuals with devious motives from ascertaining the identities of those who possess firearms. The scope of the exemption is limited to restricting the public disclosure of the name and address of the individual.<sup>92</sup>

Clearly, on its face the exemption does not permit the records custodian to withhold the firearm application or identification card in its entirety. Exemption (i) allows the identifying data, in particular, the name and address of the licensee to be deleted from the record prior to disclosure. It is exceptional that there are both an exemption prohibiting the release of the identity and a separate statute mandating confidentiality of records. 93 This lends credibility to the supposition that the legislature was especially concerned about release of this type of information.

For example: What if the records custodian receives a request for firearm records of a specifically named individual, such as, "I request all gun permits issued to John Smith"?

Here, the records custodian should withhold the entire record, because even if the name and address are redacted, the requester knows with certainty that this particular record pertains to John Smith. It is impossible for the records custodian to protect Mr. Smith's identity.

For example: Is the records custodian permitted to withhold identifying information, other than name and address, such as a criminal offender record information (C.O.R.I.) or social security numbers?

The records custodian should review all the exemptions in the Public Records Law to see whether one or more of them are applicable, redact the information and claim the proper exemptions. 94 For instance, C.O.R.I. must be redacted

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>91</sup> G. L. c. 4, § 7(26)(j). <sup>92</sup> G. L. c. 4, § 7(26)(j).

<sup>93</sup> G. L. c. 140, §§ 121-131P. (discussing sale of firearms).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>94</sup> G. L. c. 4, § 7(26) (exemptions to the Public Records Law).

before disclosing the gun application pursuant to Exemption (a), and social security numbers contained in the application may be withheld pursuant to Exemption (c). Please reference the Appendix of this Guide for other examples of statutes that specifically exempt records from disclosure.

#### **Exemption (k).** Repealed, 1988 Mass Acts 180, § 2.

Although Exemption (k) was repealed, the legislature retained the substance of the exemption, incorporating the language into another section of the General Laws. It reads: "...[T]hat part of the records of a public library which reveals the identity and intellectual pursuits of a person using such library shall not be a public record as defined by clause Twenty-sixth of section seven of chapter four<sup>95</sup>

G. L. c. 78, § 7 operates through Exemption (a) of the Public Records Law to provide a basis for denying access to library circulation records. <sup>96</sup>

#### Exemption (I)

Exemption (1) provides a basis for withholding from disclosure:

questions and answers, scoring keys and sheets and other materials used to develop, administer or score a test, examination or assessment instrument; provided, however, that such materials are intended to be used for another test, examination or assessment instrument<sup>97</sup>

The purpose of Exemption (l) is to prevent individuals from gaining an unfair advantage by using the Public Records Law to access test questions and answers prior to the administration of an examination.

As long as the same materials are used to administer subsequent examinations, the custodian of records may continue to withhold the materials pursuant to Exemption (l). The action to withhold the testing materials ensures that the integrity of future testing is not jeopardized.

**For example:** May a records custodian withhold a copy of a middle school mid-term examination, when the request is made by a parent of one of the school's students?

Where the school has proven that the test questions administered to this student on this mid-term examination will be used for future examinations, the school may properly withhold the testing materials pursuant to Exemption (1).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>95</sup> G. L. c. 78, § 7 (discussing Public Libraries).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>96</sup> G. L. c. 4, § 7(26)(a).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>97</sup> G. L. c. 4, § 7(26)(1).

**For example:** May a records custodian withhold testing materials, when a request is made for all documents related to the issue of discrimination in the Massachusetts Comprehensive Assessment System (MCAS)?

Pursuant to Exemption (l), the records custodian may properly withhold the test questions and answers, and any other testing materials that are currently used or may be used to administer subsequent MCAS examinations.

#### **Exemption (m)**

Exemption (m) applies to:

contracts for hospital or related health care services between (i) any hospital, clinic or other health care facility operated by a unit of state, county or municipal government and (ii) a health maintenance organization arrangement approved under chapter one hundred and seventy-six I, a nonprofit hospital service corporation or medical service corporation organized pursuant to chapter one hundred and seventy-six A and chapter one hundred and seventy-six B, respectively, a health insurance corporation licensed under chapter one hundred and seventy- five or any legal entity that is self insured and provides health care benefits to its employees 98

Although Exemption (m) has yet to be interpreted by any Massachusetts court, the language of the exemption is clear. The exemption pertains to contracts for hospital or healthcare services between a government-operated healthcare facility and a health maintenance organization or health insurance corporation.

To properly claim Exemption (m), the records custodian must meet all four criteria contained in the exemption: (1) the record must be a contract; (2) the contract must be for hospital or related health care services; (3) one of the contracting parties must be a government-operated medical facility; and (4) the party providing services must be one of the entities described by the exemption. If the requested record satisfies all of the criteria, the records custodian may withhold the record pursuant to Exemption (m).

**For example:** May a city or town withhold records pertaining to the health insurance plans and the costs of providing these health insurance benefits to employees of the city or town pursuant to Exemption (m)?

Exemption (m) specifically applies only to records that are contracts for hospital or related health care services. Additionally, one of the contracting parties must be a government operated medical facility, such as a hospital or clinic, and the party providing the services must be one of the entities described by the exemption. The requested records do not satisfy the criteria

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>98</sup> G. L. c. 4, § 7(26)(m).

of the exemption; therefore, the list of health insurance plans and the costs of providing these as employee benefits may not be withheld pursuant to Exemption (m).

#### Exemption (n)

Exemption (n) applies to:

records, including, but not limited to, blueprints, plans, policies, procedures and schematic drawings, which relate to internal layout and structural elements, security measures, emergency preparedness, threat or vulnerability assessments, or any other records relating to the security or safety of persons or buildings, structures, facilities, utilities, transportation, cyber security or other infrastructure located within the commonwealth, the disclosure of which, in the reasonable judgment of the record custodian, subject to review by the supervisor of public records under subsection (c) of section 10 of chapter 66, is likely to jeopardize public safety or cyber security.

This exemption is intended to secure the safety of persons and public places by restricting access to records that may have been previously open to public inspection. The nature of the exemption requires a records custodian to make some value judgment regarding the requester in order to decide whether to release the information sought.

Making such a value judgment is specifically antithetic to the previously expounded presumptions that all records are public records and all requesters shall be treated uniformly. The legislature was informed in writing of this radical and disparate change in the Public Records Law but chose to retain the language thereby clearly indicating its intent to provide records custodians with the discretion to withhold applicable records.

A records custodian should review a request for such records promptly and completely to gather all facts surrounding the request. The records custodian is not prevented from engaging the requestor in conversation by asking the requester to voluntarily provide additional information in order to reach a "reasonable judgment," but a records custodian may not "require" the requester to provide personal information.

**For example:** If a records custodian discloses a set of blueprints under Exemption (n) to one requestor, must the same blueprints be made available to all subsequent requestors?

This exemption is unique in its application in that the disclosure of records to one requestor does not render the records public to all. If a records custodian

<sup>99</sup> G. L. c. 4, § 7 (26)(n).

determines that disclosure of the records to a specific requestor would not compromise public safety, the records custodian may then withhold the same records to later requestors if, in the reasonable judgment of the records custodian, release of the records to those subsequent requestors would jeopardize public safety.

#### Exemption (o)

Exemption (o) applies to:

the home address, personal email address and home telephone number of an employee of the judicial branch, an unelected employee of the general court, an agency, executive office, department, board, commission, bureau, division or authority of the commonwealth, or of a political subdivision thereof or of an authority established by the general court to serve a public purpose, in the custody of a government agency which maintains records identifying persons as falling within those categories; provided that the information may be disclosed to an employee organization under chapter 150E, a nonprofit organization for retired public employees under chapter 180, or a criminal justice agency as defined in section 167 of chapter

For example: Would the address of a government employee found in payroll records be public?

Exemption (o) applies to records that contain the home address, personal email address or telephone number of an employee while identifying the individual as a government employee. Given that payroll records identify an individual as being a government employee while providing the employee's home address, and possibly telephone number in the same record, the home address and telephone number would be subject to redaction under this exemption.

## Exemption (p)

Exemption (p) applies to:

the name, home address, personal email address and home telephone number of a family member of a commonwealth employee, contained in a record in the custody of a government agency which maintains records identifying persons as falling within the categories listed in subclause (o). 101

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>100</sup> G. L. c. 4, § 7 (26)(o). <sup>101</sup> G. L. c. 4, § 7 (26)(p).

The record must contain an individual's home address, personal email address or telephone number and identify the individual as being the family member of a Commonwealth employee to be subject to redaction.

#### Exemption (q)

Exemption (q) allows for the withholding of:

Adoption contact information and indices therefore of the adoption contact registry established by section 31 of chapter 46<sup>102</sup>

The registry of vital records and statistics maintains a voluntary adoption contact information registry for the purpose of connecting parents listed on the initial birth certificate to any of their children who were adopted by others. The adoption contact registry contains the addresses and other information supplied by parents and adoptees necessary for one to contact the other. Any contact information contained in the adoption contact registry, as well as indices created from this registry, may be withheld under Exemption (q).

#### **Exemption (r)**

Exemption (r) applies to:

Information and records acquired under chapter 18C by the office of the child advocate 104

The records created and received by the Office of the Child Advocate pursuant to Chapter 18C may be withheld under this exemption. <sup>105</sup>

### **Exemption (s)**

Exemption (s) applies to:

trade secrets or confidential, competitively-sensitive or other proprietary information provided in the course of activities conducted by a governmental body as an energy supplier under a license granted by the department of public utilities pursuant to section 1F of chapter 164, in the course of activities conducted as a municipal aggregator under section 134 of said chapter 164 or in the course of activities conducted by a cooperative consisting of governmental entities organized pursuant to section 136 of said chapter 164, when such governmental body, municipal aggregator or cooperative determines that such disclosure will adversely affect its ability to conduct business

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>102</sup> G. L. c. 4, § 7 (26)(q).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>103</sup> G. L. c. 46, § 31.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>104</sup> G. L. c. 4, § 7 (26)(r).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>105</sup> G. L. c. 18(c).

in relation to other entities making, selling or distributing electric power and energy; provided, however, that this subclause shall not exempt a public entity from disclosure required of a private entity so licensed<sup>106</sup>

Exemption (s) relates to certain records of public utility providers.

#### **Exemption (t)**

Exemption (t) applies to:

statements filed under section 20C of chapter 32<sup>107</sup>

Members of public retirement boards are required by statute to file a statement of financial interest with the Public Employee Retirement Administration Commission. The statement of financial interest document is exempt from disclosure under Exemption (t). 108

### Exemption (u)

Exemption (u) applies to:

trade secrets or other proprietary information of the University of Massachusetts, including trade secrets or proprietary information provided to the University by research sponsors or private concerns 109

This exemption applies to certain records in the possession of the University of Massachusetts.

<sup>106</sup> G. L. c. 4, § 7 (26)(s). 107 G. L. c. 4, § 7 (26)(t). 108 See G. L. c. 32, § 20C. 109 G. L. c. 4, § 7 (26)(u).

# **Attorney-Client Communications and Attorney Work Product**

In <u>Suffolk Construction Co.</u>, Inc. v. <u>Division of Capital Asset Management</u> (<u>Suffolk</u>), the Massachusetts Supreme Judicial Court (Court) held that confidential communications between governmental entities and their legal counsel undertaken for the purpose of obtaining legal advice or assistance are protected under the normal rules of the attorney-client privilege. <sup>110</sup>

The legislature conferred to the Supervisor of Records (Supervisor) the authority to render determinations on the public status of records. 111 Additionally, the Court has interpreted the Supervisor's authority to include issuing decisions on whether records are privileged. 112 As a result, the Supervisor has the authority to determine whether records may be withheld as privileged documents. This office will issue determinations regarding this privilege on a case-by-case basis.

### **Computer Records**

The statutory definition of "public records" does not distinguish between paper records and electronically stored information (ESI). Rather, the law provides that all information made or received by a public entity, regardless of the manner in which it exists, constitutes "public records." A records custodian is obliged to furnish copies of non-exempt portions of computerized information at the cost of reproduction, unless otherwise provided by law.

To the extent feasible, RAOs must provide public records to a requester in electronic format unless the record is not available in electronic form or the requester does not have the ability to receive or access the records in electronic format. If feasible, the records should be provided in the requester's preferred format. In the absence of a preferred format, the records must be provided in a searchable machine-readable form. 114

It should be noted, however, that as with paper records a records custodian is not required to create a computer record in response to a request for information. A records custodian is only obliged to provide access to existing files. A records custodian is not required to create a new computer program to provide a requester with computerized information in a desired format. There is, however, an exception to this general rule when the reprogramming is needed to comply with the segregation provision of the law.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>110</sup> Suffolk Constr. Co. v. Div. of Capital Asset Mgmt., 449 Mass. 444, 449-50 (2007).

G. L. c. 66, § 10 (b); See Hull Municipal Lighting Plant v. Massachusetts Municipal Wholesale Electric Co., 414 Mass. 609, 614-15 (1993).

<sup>112 &</sup>lt;u>See Id.</u> at 610 (Supervisor may delineate whether documents are privileged or exempted from the Public Records Law).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>113</sup> G. L. c. 4, § 7(26).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>114</sup> 950 CMR 32.04(5).

*For example:* A request is made for a spreadsheet summarizing expenses for various goods purchased by a government entity.

A records custodian is not obligated to create a new record if such a record does not exist at the time of the request. In this situation, the RAO is only obliged to notify the requester that there is no record responsive to the request. The RAO should also advise the requester of other available documents or files that could be responsive to the request.

The creation of records, including the honoring of prospective requests, is not governed by the Public Records Law; therefore, the RAO is free to negotiate all terms of the arrangement. Consequently, if a requester is willing to pay for the work, the records custodian may create a digital record to respond to the request.

# **Geographic Information Systems (GIS)**

A GIS is a computer system designed to store, capture, analyze and display geographically referenced information. Often, the information that comprises Commonwealth or municipal GIS databases is submitted by private surveyors and engineers who exercise intellectual property rights over nonfactual portions of the materials.

While there are no Massachusetts court cases interpreting this issue, it is clear that the legislature did not carve out specific exemptions from the Massachusetts Public Records Law allowing protected intellectual property in the custody of a governmental entity to be withheld from public dissemination. The Public Records Law does not serve to preempt federal intellectual property law, nor does the Public Records Law exonerate those who violate intellectual property rights validly held by private individuals or governmental entities once the public GIS records have been released. As a precaution, records custodians of GIS records are encouraged to indicate on released GIS records that the information contained in the records may be subject to intellectual property protections.

Given that GIS records are public, the fees a municipal records custodian may assess for access to these records have been statutorily set. GIS records fall under the category of public records that are not susceptible to ordinary means of reproduction, thus, the Public Records Access Regulations provide that the records custodian may assess the actual cost incurred in copying the requested

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>115</sup> G. L. c. 4, § 7(26) (defining "public records" as materials which have already been "made or received" by a public entity); see also 32 Op. Att'y Gen. 157, 165 (May 18, 1977) (custodian is not obliged to create a record in response to a request for information) (the Public Records Law and Regulations only apply to existing records; consequently, a custodian is free to set any fee for creating a record).

records. 116 Fees assessed for these records cannot serve as a deterrent for access or as a means of generating revenue.

# The Supervisor of Records

A requester who is denied access to any requested information may petition the Supervisor of Records (Supervisor) for a review of the request. The Supervisor will then instruct a staff attorney or another staff member to contact the RAO and requester as needed to ascertain the relevant facts and applicable law. The findings are then reported to the Supervisor to assist in making a decision. The RAO will receive an administrative order if the Supervisor determines that records are being improperly withheld or the proposed fee is excessive. <sup>117</sup> If the records custodian does not comply with an order issued by the Supervisor, the case may be referred to the Office of the Attorney General for enforcement. <sup>118</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>116</sup> 950 C.M.R. 32.07(2)(h).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>117</sup> G. L. c. 66, § 10A.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>118</sup> G. L. c. 66, § 10A; 950 CMR 32.08.

# **Records Management**

As the chief information officer for the Commonwealth, Secretary of the Commonwealth William F. Galvin recognizes the importance of maintaining records properly. With this understanding, the Secretary strongly encourages the creation, adoption and implementation of a formal, written records management program that includes specific standards for both paper and electronic records.

In accordance with regulations promulgated by the Records Conservation Board (RCB), each agency of the Commonwealth is required to submit Form RCB-4 on an annual basis. Similarly, municipal agencies must submit Form RMU-4. This Form states the name and title of each agency's designated records management officer or Records Liaison Officer. These forms are available on the web at <a href="https://www.sec.state.ma.us/arc/arcrmu/rmuidx.htm">www.sec.state.ma.us/arc/arcrmu/rmuidx.htm</a>.

If you need assistance filing out this form, or need additional information or assistance in creating a Records Management Program, please contact the Records Management Unit at 617-727-2816 or the Public Records Division at 617-727-2832.

## **Electronic Records Storage**

The Records Conservation Board (RCB) implemented *Electronic Records Management Guidelines* to assist records custodians in maintaining electronic records. Records custodians are encouraged to review the *Statewide Records Retention Schedule* or the *Municipal Records Retention Manual* for more information on retention periods for records.

Records with a retention period of less than ten (10) years may be stored exclusively electronically once the agency's computer storage system has been approved and the proper Application for Destruction Permission forms have been submitted and approved. State agencies must submit forms *RCB-1E* and *RCB-2E* to the RCB. Municipalities must submit forms *RMU-1E* and *RMU-2E* to the Supervisor for approval. If you have any questions regarding electronic records and storage, please do not hesitate to contact the Records Management Unit at 617-727-2816.

### **Records Retention**

It is the responsibility of government employees who create, receive and maintain public records to ensure their safekeeping and availability to the public.

www.sec.state.ma.us/arc/arcpdf/Electronic Records Guidelines.pdf.

An RAO's obligations include not only responding to public records requests but also ensuring that records will be available for review when requested. Therefore, an RAO may not dispose of records until the retention period for the specific records series has expired, and disposal of records has been approved by the Supervisor of Records or the Records Conservation Board (RCB).

Retention schedules for state and municipal agencies, as well as information on records management, including permission forms for disposal of records, may be accessed through the Secretary of the Commonwealth's website, at <a href="https://www.sec.state.ma.us/arc/arcrmu/rmuidx.htm">www.sec.state.ma.us/arc/arcrmu/rmuidx.htm</a>.

The RCB is empowered "to require all departments of the Commonwealth to report to it what series of records they hold, to set standards for the management and preservation of such records, and to establish schedules for the destruction, in whole, or in part, and transfer to the archives or another appropriate division within the office of the state secretary, in whole, or in part, of records no longer needed for current business." <sup>120</sup>

The Records Management Unit (RMU) was created to provide records management services and outreach to all state agencies and municipalities to help them meet state record-keeping standards and requirements. The RMU can provide agencies with retention schedules for specific records, as well as information on proper disposal and destruction of records.

 $<sup>^{120}</sup>$  G. L. c. 30, § 42.

### **Records Disposal Schedules**

There are records disposal schedules for state agencies and municipal agencies. Schedules describe records created as a result of a particular activity; identify the content of the record; describe how the record is used; and specify the lifecycle of the record.

### **Municipal Government**

Municipal agencies must obtain the written permission of the Supervisor of Records prior to destroying records. See the *Municipal Records Retention Manual* for more information and instructions.

The following is a list of forms available on the Records Management Unit homepage <a href="www.sec.state.ma.us/arc/arcrmu/rmuidx.htm">www.sec.state.ma.us/arc/arcrmu/rmuidx.htm</a> via the link to <a href="mailto:Municipal Agency Forms">Municipal Agency Forms</a>:

### **RMU-1E**

### Application for Systems Information Management Plan

Use this form to obtain approval for a retention plan for electronic record keeping systems and databases.

### RMU-2E

### Application for Scanning and Destruction Permission

Use this form in conjunction with a previously approved RMU-1E form.

### RMU-2

Application for Destruction Permission

#### RMU-2M

### Application for Scanning and Destruction Permission

Use this form for records required to be microfilmed before they are destroyed.

### RMU-4

### Records Liaison Officer Designation

Use this form to appoint an authorized agent for Records Management Unit business.

### State Government

State agencies must obtain the written permission of the Records Conservation Board (RCB) prior to destroying records. State records custodians must be aware of the retention requirements for their records. The RCB has combined what were once many separate retention schedules into one *Statewide Records Retention Schedule* (Schedule). The Schedule may be used by state agencies in filing requests for destruction of records, as well as scanning, transferring and microfilming records.

The following is a list of RCB forms, available on the Records Management Unit homepage, via the link to *State Agency Forms*:

### RCB-1E

### Application for Systems Information Management Plan

Use this form to obtain approval for a retention plan for electronic record keeping systems and databases.

### RCB-2E

### Application for Scanning and Destruction Permission

Use this form in conjunction with a previously approved RCB-1E form.

### RCB-2

Application for Destruction Permission

### RCB-2M

### Application for Scanning and Destruction Permission

Use this form for records required to be microfilmed before they are destroyed.

### RCB-2T

### Application for Transfer Permission

Use this form to request permission to implement the transfer provisions. This form can be used for both transfer to the State Records Center and the Massachusetts Archives.

### RCB-4

### Records Liaison Officer Designation

Use this form to appoint an authorized agent for Records Conservation Board business.

### Maintenance and Storage of Public Records

Public records must be maintained and kept in a manner that allows access by the general public, as they are subject to mandatory disclosure upon request. 121

The Supervisor of Records is responsible for ensuring that the records of the Commonwealth and municipalities are maintained and stored as required by law. 122 In accordance with this duty, the following procedures have been established to ensure security of and access to public records.

#### 1. **Records Access Officers (RAOs)**

RAOs shall assist the custodian in preserving public records in accordance with all applicable laws, rules, regulations and retention schedules 123

#### 2. **Original Records Removed from Municipal Offices**

- a. Whenever original public records are removed from municipal offices for use in the regular course of business to a private office or home, they shall be stored in fire-resistant devices and safes provided by the municipality. 124
- b. If fire-resistant storage outside of the municipal building cannot be ensured, then no original records may be removed. However, the RAO may create copies of records for use in a private office or home.

#### 3. **Original Records Created Outside of Municipal Offices**

- a. Whenever original public records are created outside the municipal offices, they shall be transferred on a regular and frequent basis to secure storage in the municipal building.
- b. If secure storage is available in an individual's private office or home, then copies of the records shall be maintained in the municipal building, with the originals stored in secure storage at the records custodian's private office or home.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>121</sup> G. L. c. 66, § 10(a); see also Reinstein v. Police Comm'r of Boston, 378 Mass. 281, 289-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>122</sup> See G. L. c. 66, § 1.

<sup>123</sup> G.L. c. 66, §6A(b); 950 C.M.R. 32.04(5). 124 G. L. c. 66, § 11.

### 4. Availability of RAO

Whenever it is necessary to work, or to keep original public records, in a location other than the municipal building, RAOs shall be available during regular posted office hours, at a location convenient to the general public, for inspection and copying of the public records.

Please note that in such situations, copies of the public records must also be maintained in the municipal building, in accordance with paragraph 2(b), above.

In those instances in which the governmental entity does not have regular business hours, a written notice shall be posted in a conspicuous location, listing the name, position, address and telephone number of the person to be contacted to obtain access to public records. <sup>125</sup>

# 5. Transfer of Public Records upon Termination of Duties as Government Employee

a. Whenever a government employee relinquishes his office or terminates his duties, he shall deliver over to his successor all such public records that he is not authorized by law to retain. 126

These procedures are designed to ensure the safekeeping of public records so that compliance with the Massachusetts Public Records Law by governmental entities is best accomplished.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>125</sup> 950 CMR 32.04(4).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>126</sup> <u>See</u> G. L. c. 66, § 14.

# **Appendix**

The provisions in this book are not the official versions of the Massachusetts General Laws (MGL) or Code of Massachusetts Regulations (CMR). Reasonable efforts have been undertaken to assure the validity of the information provided at the time of publishing; however, do not depend on this information without first consulting an official edition of the MGL or CMR.

### **Public Records Law**

G. L. c. 4, § 7(26)

Twenty–sixth, "Public records" shall mean all books, papers, maps, photographs, recorded tapes, financial statements, statistical tabulations, or other documentary materials or data, regardless of physical form or characteristics, made or received by any officer or employee of any agency, executive office, department, board, commission, bureau, division or authority of the commonwealth, or of any political subdivision thereof, or of any authority established by the general court to serve a public purpose, or any person, corporation, association, partnership or other legal entity which receives or expends public funds for the payment or administration of pensions for any current or former employees of the commonwealth or any political subdivision as defined in section 1 of chapter 32, unless such materials or data fall within the following exemptions in that they are:

- (a) specifically or by necessary implication exempted from disclosure by statute;
- (b) related solely to internal personnel rules and practices of the government unit, provided however, that such records shall be withheld only to the extent that proper performance of necessary governmental functions requires such withholding;
- (c) personnel and medical files or information; also any other materials or data relating to a specifically named individual, the disclosure of which may constitute an unwarranted invasion of personal privacy;
- (d) inter-agency or intra-agency memoranda or letters relating to policy positions being developed by the agency; but this subclause shall not apply to reasonably completed factual studies or reports on which the development of such policy positions has been or may be based;
- (e) notebooks and other materials prepared by an employee of the commonwealth which are personal to him and not maintained as part of the files of the governmental unit;

- (f) investigatory materials necessarily compiled out of the public view by law enforcement or other investigatory officials the disclosure of which materials would probably so prejudice the possibility of effective law enforcement that such disclosure would not be in the public interest;
- (g) trade secrets or commercial or financial information voluntarily provided to an agency for use in developing governmental policy and upon a promise of confidentiality; but this subclause shall not apply to information submitted as required by law or as a condition of receiving a governmental contract or other benefit;
- (h) proposals and bids to enter into any contract or agreement until the time for the opening of bids in the case of proposals or bids to be opened publicly, and until the time for the receipt of bids or proposals has expired in all other cases; and inter–agency or intra–agency communications made in connection with an evaluation process for reviewing bids or proposals, prior to a decision to enter into negotiations with or to award a contract to, a particular person; (i) appraisals of real property acquired or to be acquired until (1) a final agreement is entered into; or (2) any litigation relative to such appraisal has been terminated; or (3) the time within which to commence such litigation has expired;
- (j) the names and addresses of any persons contained in, or referred to in, any applications for any licenses to carry or possess firearms issued pursuant to chapter one hundred and forty or any firearms identification cards issued pursuant to said chapter one hundred and forty and the names and addresses on sales or transfers of any firearms, rifles, shotguns, or machine guns or ammunition therefor, as defined in said chapter one hundred and forty and the names and addresses on said licenses or cards;

### (k) [Stricken.]

- (l) questions and answers, scoring keys and sheets and other materials used to develop, administer or score a test, examination or assessment instrument; provided, however, that such materials are intended to be used for another test, examination or assessment instrument;
- (m) contracts for hospital or related health care services between (i) any hospital, clinic or other health care facility operated by a unit of state, county or municipal government and (ii) a health maintenance organization arrangement approved under chapter one hundred and seventy—six I, a nonprofit hospital service corporation or medical service corporation organized pursuant to chapter one hundred and seventy—six A and chapter one hundred and seventy—six B, respectively, a health insurance corporation licensed under chapter one hundred and seventy—five or any legal entity that is self insured and provides health care benefits to its employees.

- (n) records, including, but not limited to, blueprints, plans, policies, procedures and schematic drawings, which relate to internal layout and structural elements, security measures, emergency preparedness, threat or vulnerability assessments, or any other records relating to the security or safety of persons or buildings, structures, facilities, utilities, transportation, cyber security or other infrastructure located within the commonwealth, the disclosure of which, in the reasonable judgment of the record custodian, subject to review by the supervisor of public records under subsection (c) of section 10 of chapter 66, is likely to jeopardize public safety or cyber security.
- (o) the home address, personal email address and home telephone number of an employee of the judicial branch, an unelected employee of the general court, an agency, executive office, department, board, commission, bureau, division or authority of the commonwealth, or of a political subdivision thereof or of an authority established by the general court to serve a public purpose, in the custody of a government agency which maintains records identifying persons as falling within those categories; provided that the information may be disclosed to an employee organization under chapter 150E, a nonprofit organization for retired public employees under chapter 180, or a criminal justice agency as defined in section 167 of chapter 6.
- (p) the name, home address, personal email address and home telephone number of a family member of a commonwealth employee, contained in a record in the custody of a government agency which maintains records identifying persons as falling within the categories listed in subclause (o).
- (q) Adoption contact information and indices therefore of the adoption contact registry established by section 31 of chapter 46.
- (r) Information and records acquired under chapter 18C by the office of the child advocate.
- (s) trade secrets or confidential, competitively-sensitive or other proprietary information provided in the course of activities conducted by a governmental body as an energy supplier under a license granted by the department of public utilities pursuant to section 1F of chapter 164, in the course of activities conducted as a municipal aggregator under section 134 of said chapter 164 or in the course of activities conducted by a cooperative consisting of governmental entities organized pursuant to section 136 of said chapter 164, when such governmental body, municipal aggregator or cooperative determines that such disclosure will adversely affect its ability to conduct business in relation to other entities making, selling or distributing electric power and energy; provided, however, that this subclause shall not exempt a public entity from disclosure required of a private entity so licensed.
- (t) statements filed under section 20C of chapter 32.

(u) trade secrets or other proprietary information of the University of Massachusetts, including trade secrets or proprietary information provided to the University by research sponsors or private concerns.

Any person denied access to public records may pursue the remedy provided for in section 10A of chapter sixty–six.

### **Records Access Officers**

### G. L. c. 66, § 6A

- (a) Each agency and municipality shall designate 1 or more employees as records access officers. In a municipality, the municipal clerk, or the clerk's designees, or any designee of a municipality that the chief executive officer of the municipality may appoint, shall serve as records access officers. For the purposes of this chapter the term "agency" shall mean any entity, other than a municipality, that is identified in clause twenty-sixth of section 7 of chapter 4 as possessing "public records," as defined therein.
- (b) A records access officer shall coordinate an agency's or a municipality's response to requests for access to public records and shall facilitate the resolution of such requests by the timely and thorough production of public records. Each records access officer shall:
  - (i) assist persons seeking public records to identify the records sought;
  - (ii) assist the custodian of records in preserving public records in accordance with all applicable laws, rules, regulations and schedules; and
  - (iii) prepare guidelines that enable a person seeking access to public records in the custody of the agency or municipality to make informed requests regarding the availability of such public records electronically or otherwise.

Guidelines shall be updated periodically and shall include a list of categories of public records maintained by the agency or municipality. Each agency and municipality that maintains a website shall post the guidelines on its website.

(c) Each agency and municipality shall post in a conspicuous location at its offices and on its website, if any, the name, title, business address, business telephone number, and business email address of each records access officer. The designation of 1 or more records access officers shall not be construed to prohibit employees who have been previously authorized to make public records or information available to the public from continuing to do so. Any

### 44 • A Guide to the Massachusetts Public Records Law

employee responsible for making public records available shall provide the records in accordance with this chapter.

- (d) The records access officer shall provide the public records to a requestor by electronic means unless the record is not available in electronic form or the requestor does not have the ability to receive or access the records in a usable electronic form. The records access officer shall, to the extent feasible, provide the public record in the requestor's preferred format or, in the absence of a preferred format, in a searchable, machine readable format. The records access officer shall not be required to create a new public record in order to comply with a request, provided that furnishing a segregable portion of a public record shall not be deemed to be creation of a new record. If the public record requested is available on a public website pursuant to subsection (b) of section 19 of this chapter, section 14C of chapter 7 or any other appropriately indexed and searchable public website, the records access officer may furnish the public record by providing reasonable assistance in locating the requested record on the public website. An electronically produced document submitted to an agency or municipality for use in deliberations by a public body shall be provided in an electronic format at the time of submission.
- (e) Each records access officer of an agency shall document each request for public records submitted to the records access officer. The records access officer shall document:
  - (i) the nature of the request and the date on which the request was received;
  - (ii) the date on which a response is provided to the requestor;
  - (iii) the date on which a public record is provided to the requestor;
  - (iv) the number of hours required to fulfill the request;
  - (v) fees charged to the person making the request, if any;
  - (vi) petitions submitted under clause (iv) of subsection (d) of section 10:
  - (vii) requests appealed under section 10A;
  - (viii) the time required to comply with supervisor of records orders under said section 10A; and
  - (ix) the final adjudication of any court proceedings under subsection (d) of said section 10A.

Nothing in this subsection shall require a records access officer to disclose information otherwise protected from public access. The secretary of the commonwealth shall prescribe a form for recording such information and shall annually collect the information from the records access officers, post the information on a website maintained by the secretary and report the same to the clerks of the house of representatives and senate.

- (f) The supervisor of records shall document appeals filed under section 10A, including:
  - (i) the date the request was submitted to the records access officer;
  - (ii) the date the records access officer responded;
  - (iii) the amount of fees charged to the requestor, if any;
  - (iv) petitions made pursuant to clause (iv) of subsection (d) of section 10;
  - (v) the time required to comply with supervisor of records orders under said section 10A; and
  - (vi) the final adjudication of any court proceedings under subsection (d) of said section 10A.

Nothing in this subsection shall require the supervisor to disclose information otherwise protected from public access. The secretary of the commonwealth shall prescribe a form for recording such information and shall post the information on a website maintained by the secretary.

# **Public Inspection and Copies of Records**

### G. L. c. 66, § 10

- (a) A records access officer appointed pursuant to section 6A, or a designee, shall at reasonable times and without unreasonable delay permit inspection or furnish a copy of any public record as defined in clause twenty-sixth of section 7 of chapter 4, or any segregable portion of a public record, not later than 10 business days following the receipt of the request, provided that:
  - (i) the request reasonably describes the public record sought;
  - (ii) the public record is within the possession, custody or control of the agency or municipality that the records access officer serves; and

(iii) the records access officer receives payment of a reasonable fee as set forth in subsection (d).

A request for public records may be delivered to the records access officer by hand or via first class mail at the record officer's business address, or via electronic mail to the address posted by the agency or municipality that the records access officer serves.

- (b) If the agency or municipality does not intend to permit inspection or furnish a copy of a requested record, or the magnitude or difficulty of the request, or of multiple requests from the same requestor, unduly burdens the other responsibilities of the agency or municipality such that the agency or municipality is unable to do so within the timeframe established in subsection (a), the agency or municipality shall inform the requestor in writing not later than 10 business days after the initial receipt of the request for public records. The written response shall be made via first class or electronic mail and shall:
  - (i) confirm receipt of the request;
  - (ii) identify any public records or categories of public records sought that are not within the possession, custody, or control of the agency or municipality that the records access officer serves;
  - (iii) identify the agency or municipality that may be in possession, custody or control of the public record sought, if known;
  - (iv) identify any records, categories of records or portions of records that the agency or municipality intends to withhold, and provide the specific reasons for such withholding, including the specific exemption or exemptions upon which the withholding is based, provided that nothing in the written response shall limit an agency's or municipality's ability to redact or withhold information in accordance with state or federal law;
  - (v) identify any public records, categories of records, or portions of records that the agency or municipality intends to produce, and provide a detailed statement describing why the magnitude or difficulty of the request unduly burdens the other responsibilities of the agency or municipality and therefore requires additional time to produce the public records sought;
  - (vi) identify a reasonable timeframe in which the agency or municipality shall produce the public records sought; provided, that for an agency, the timeframe shall not exceed 15 business days following the initial receipt of the request for public records and for a municipality the timeframe shall not exceed 25 business

days following the initial receipt of the request for public records; and provided further, that the requestor may voluntarily agree to a response date beyond the timeframes set forth herein;

- (vii) suggest a reasonable modification of the scope of the request or offer to assist the requestor to modify the scope of the request if doing so would enable the agency or municipality to produce records sought more efficiently and affordably;
- (viii) include an itemized, good faith estimate of any fees that may be charged to produce the records; and
- (ix) include a statement informing the requestor of the right of appeal to the supervisor of records under subsection (a) of section 10A and the right to seek judicial review of an unfavorable decision by commencing a civil action in the superior court under subsection (c) of section 10A.
- (c) If the magnitude or difficulty of a request, or the receipt of multiple requests from the same requestor, unduly burdens the other responsibilities of the agency or municipality such that an agency or municipality is unable to complete the request within the time provided in clause (vi) of subsection (b), a records access officer may, as soon as practical and within 20 business days after initial receipt of the request, or within 10 business days after receipt of a determination by the supervisor of public records that the requested record constitutes a public record, petition the supervisor of records for an extension of the time for the agency or municipality to furnish copies of the requested record, or any portion of the requested record, that the agency or municipality has within its possession, custody or control and intends to furnish. The records access officer shall, upon submitting the petition to the supervisor of records, furnish a copy of the petition to the requestor. Upon a showing of good cause, the supervisor of records may grant a single extension to an agency not to exceed 20 business days and a single extension to a municipality not to exceed 30 business days. In determining whether the agency or municipality has established good cause, the supervisor of records shall consider, but shall not be limited to considering:
  - (i) the need to search for, collect, segregate or examine records;
  - (ii) the scope of redaction required to prevent unlawful disclosure;
  - (iii) the capacity or the normal business hours of operation of the agency or municipality to produce the request without the extension;
  - (iv) efforts undertaken by the agency or municipality in fulfilling the current request and previous requests;

- (v) whether the request, either individually or as part of a series of requests from the same requestor, is frivolous or intended to harass or intimidate the agency or municipality; and
- (vi) the public interest served by expeditious disclosure.

If the supervisor of records determines that the request is part of a series of contemporaneous requests that are frivolous or designed to intimidate or harass, and the requests are not intended for the broad dissemination of information to the public about actual or alleged government activity, the supervisor of records may grant a longer extension or relieve the agency or municipality of its obligation to provide copies of the records sought. The supervisor of records shall issue a written decision regarding a petition submitted by a records access officer under this subsection within 5 business days following receipt of the petition. The supervisor of records shall provide the decision to the agency or municipality and the requestor and shall inform the requestor of the right to seek judicial review of an unfavorable decision by commencing a civil action in the superior court.

- (d) A records access officer may assess a reasonable fee for the production of a public record except those records that are freely available for public inspection. The reasonable fee shall not exceed the actual cost of reproducing the record. Unless expressly provided for otherwise, the fee shall be determined in accordance with the following:
  - (i) the actual cost of any storage device or material provided to a person in response to a request for public records under subsection (a) may be included as part of the fee, but the fee assessed for standard black and white paper copies or printouts of records shall not exceed 5 cents per page, for both single and double-sided black and white copies or printouts;
  - (ii) if an agency is required to devote more than 4 hours of employee time to search for, compile, segregate, redact or reproduce the record or records requested, the records access officer may also include as part of the fee an hourly rate equal to or less than the hourly rate attributed to the lowest paid employee who has the necessary skill required to search for, compile, segregate, redact or reproduce a record requested, but the fee (A) shall not be more than \$25 per hour; (B) shall not be assessed for the first 4 hours of work performed; and (C) shall not be assessed for time spent segregating or redacting records unless such segregation or redaction is required by law or approved by the supervisor of records under clause (iv);
  - (iii) if a municipality is required to devote more than 2 hours of employee time to search for, compile, segregate, redact or reproduce a record requested, the records access

officer may include as part of the fee an hourly rate equal to or less than the hourly rate attributed to the lowest paid employee who has the necessary skill required to search for, compile, segregate, redact or reproduce the record requested but the fee (A) shall not be more than \$25 per hour unless such rate is approved by the supervisor of records under clause (iv); (B) shall not be assessed for the first 2 hours of work performed where the responding municipality has a population of over 20,000 people; and (C) shall not be assessed for time spent segregating or redacting records unless such segregation or redaction is required by law or approved by the supervisor of records under clause (iv);

- (iv) the supervisor of records may approve a petition from an agency or municipality to charge for time spent segregating or redacting, or a petition from a municipality to charge in excess of \$25 per hour, if the supervisor of records determines that (A) the request is for a commercial purpose; or (B) the fee represents an actual and good faith representation by the agency or municipality to comply with the request, the fee is necessary such that the request could not have been prudently completed without the redaction, segregation or fee in excess of \$25 per hour and the amount of the fee is reasonable and the fee is not designed to limit, deter or prevent access to requested public records; provided, however, that:
  - 1. in making a determination regarding any such petition, the supervisor of records shall consider the public interest served by limiting the cost of public access to the records, the financial ability of the requestor to pay the additional or increased fees and any other relevant extenuating circumstances;
  - 2. an agency or municipality, upon submitting a petition under this clause, shall furnish a copy of the petition to the requestor;
  - 3. the supervisor of records shall issue a written determination with findings regarding any such petition within 5 business days following receipt of the petition by the supervisor of public records; and
  - 4. the supervisor of records shall provide the determination to the agency or municipality and the requestor and shall inform the requestor of the right to seek judicial review of an unfavorable decision by commencing a civil action in the superior court;

- (v) the records access officer may waive or reduce the amount of any fee charged under this subsection upon a showing that disclosure of a requested record is in the public interest because it is likely to contribute significantly to public understanding of the operations or activities of the government and is not primarily in the commercial interest of the requestor, or upon a showing that the requestor lacks the financial ability to pay the full amount of the reasonable fee;
- (vi) the records access officer may deny public records requests from a requester who has failed to compensate the agency or municipality for previously produced public records;
- (vii) the records access officer shall provide a written notification to the requester detailing the reasons behind the denial, including an itemized list of any balances attributed to previously produced records;
- (viii) a records access officer may not require the requester to specify the purpose for a request, except to determine whether the records are requested for a commercial purpose or whether to grant a request for a fee waiver; and
- (ix) as used in this section "commercial purpose" shall mean the sale or resale of any portion of the public record or the use of information from the public record to advance the requester's strategic business interests in a manner that the requester can reasonably expect to make a profit, and shall not include gathering or reporting news or gathering information to promote citizen oversight or further the understanding of the operation or activities of government or or academic, scientific, journalistic or public research or education
- (e) A records access officer shall not charge a fee for a public record unless the records access officer responded to the requestor within 10 business days under subsection (b).
- (f) As used in this section, "employee time" means time required by employees or necessary vendors, including outside legal counsel, technology and payroll consultants or others as needed by the municipality.

### **Administrative and Judicial Remedies**

### G. L. c. 66, § 10A

- (a) If an agency or municipality fails to comply with a requirement of section 10 or issues a response the requestor believes in violation of section 10, the person who submitted the initial request for public records may petition the supervisor of records for a determination as to whether a violation has occurred. In assessing whether a violation has occurred, the supervisor of records may inspect any record or copy of a record in camera; provided, however, that where a record has been withheld on the basis of a claim of the attorney-client privilege, the supervisor of records shall not inspect the record but shall require, as part of the decision making process, that the agency or municipality provide a detailed description of the record, including the names of the author and recipients, the date, the substance of such record, and the grounds upon which the attorney-client privilege is being claimed. If an agency or municipality elects to provide a record, claimed to be subject to the attorney-client privilege, to the supervisor of records for in camera inspection, said inspection shall not waive any legally applicable privileges, including without limitation, the attorney- client privilege and the attorney work product privilege. The supervisor of records shall issue a written determination regarding any petition submitted in accordance with this section not later than 10 business days following receipt of the petition by the supervisor of records. Upon a determination by the supervisor of records that a violation has occurred, the supervisor of records shall order timely and appropriate relief. A requestor, aggrieved by an order issued by the supervisor of records or upon the failure of the supervisor of records to issue a timely determination, may obtain judicial review only through an action in superior court seeking relief in the nature of certiorari under section 4 of chapter 249 and as prescribed in subsection (d).
- (b) If an agency or municipality refuses or fails to comply with an order issued by the supervisor of records, the supervisor of records may notify the attorney general who, after consultation with the supervisor of records, may take whatever measures the attorney general considers necessary to ensure compliance. If the attorney general files an action to compel compliance, the action shall be filed in Suffolk superior court with respect to state agencies and, with respect to municipalities, in the superior court in the county in which the municipality is located. The attorney general shall designate an individual within the office of the attorney general to serve as a primary point of contact for the supervisor of records. In addition to any other duties the attorney general may impose, the designee shall serve as a primary point of contact within the office of the attorney general regarding notice from the supervisor of records that an agency or municipality has refused or failed to comply with an order issued by the supervisor of records.

- (c) Notwithstanding the procedure in subsections (a) or (b), a requestor may initiate a civil action to enforce the requirements of this chapter. Any action under this subsection shall be filed in Suffolk superior court with respect to agencies and, with respect to municipalities, in the superior court in the county in which the municipality is located. The superior court shall have available all remedies at law or in equity; provided, however, that any damages awarded shall be consistent with subsection (d).
- (d)(1) In any action filed by a requestor pursuant to this section:
  - (i) the superior court shall have jurisdiction to enjoin agency or municipal action;
  - (ii) the superior court shall determine the propriety of any agency or municipal action de novo and may inspect the contents of any defendant agency or municipality record in camera, provided, however, that the in camera review shall not waive any legally applicable privileges, including without limitation, the attorney- client privilege and the attorney work product privilege;
  - (iii) the superior court shall, when feasible, expedite the proceeding;
  - (iv) a presumption shall exist that each record sought is public and the burden shall be on the defendant agency or municipality to prove, by a preponderance of the evidence, that such record or portion of the record may be withheld in accordance with state or federal law.
- (2) The superior court may award reasonable attorney fees and costs in any case in which the requester obtains relief through a judicial order, consent decree, or the provision of requested documents after the filing of a complaint. There shall be a presumption in favor of an award of fees and costs unless the agency or municipality establishes that:
  - (i) the supervisor found that the agency or municipality did not violate this chapter;
  - (ii) the agency or municipality reasonably relied upon a published opinion of an appellate court of the commonwealth based on substantially similar facts;
  - (iii) the agency or municipality reasonably relied upon a published opinion by the attorney general based on substantially similar facts;
  - (iv) the request was designed or intended to harass or intimidate; or
  - (v) the request was not in the public interest and made for a commercial purpose unrelated to disseminating information to the public about actual or alleged government activity.

If the superior court determines that an award of reasonable attorney fees or costs is not warranted, the judge shall issue written findings specifying the reasons for the denial.

- (3) If the superior court awards reasonable attorneys' fees and other litigation costs reasonably incurred to the requestor, it shall order the agency or municipality to waive any fee assessed under subsection (d) of section 10. If the superior court does not award reasonable attorneys' fees and other litigation costs reasonably incurred to the requestor, it may order the agency or municipality to waive any fee assessed under said subsection (d) of said section 10. Whether the superior court determines to waive any fee assessed under said subsection (d) of said section 10, it shall issue findings specifying the basis for such decision.
- (4) If a requestor has obtained judgment in superior court in a case under this section and has demonstrated that the defendant agency or municipality, in withholding or failing to timely furnish the requested record or any portion of the record or in assessing an unreasonable fee, did not act in good faith, the superior court may assess punitive damages against the defendant agency or municipality in an amount not less than \$1,000 nor more than \$5,000, to be deposited into the Public Records Assistance Fund established in section 35DDD of chapter 10.
- (e) Notwithstanding any other provision of this chapter, the attorney general may, at any time, file a complaint in Suffolk superior court with respect to agencies and, with respect to municipalities, in the superior court in the county in which the municipality is located, to ensure compliance with this chapter and may further intervene as of right in any action filed in accordance with this section. In any action filed or in which the attorney general has intervened under this subsection, paragraphs (1) and (4) of subsection (d) shall apply and any public records the court orders produced shall be provided without a fee.

# 1973 Mass Acts c. 1050, § 6

The provisions of clause twenty-sixth of section seven of chapter four of the General Laws, as amended by section one of this act, shall not be construed to exempt any record which was a public record on the effective date of this act from said clause twenty-sixth.

# **Public Records Regulations**

950 CMR 32.00: PUBLIC RECORDS ACCESS

### Section

32.01: Scope and Purpose

32.02: Definitions

32.03: General Provisions

32.04: Records Access Officers

32.05: Additional Records Access Officer Responsibilities

32.06: Rights of Access

32.07: Copies of Records; Fees

32.08: Appeals

32.09: Enforcement of Orders32.10: Advisory Opinions

### 32.01: Scope and Purpose

- (1) 950 CMR 32.00 describes the practices and procedures of the Division of Public Records relative to the requirements of governmental entities or political subdivisions of the Commonwealth with respect to disclosure of public records, reporting requirements for certain records access officers and ensuring that disputes regarding access to particular records are resolved expeditiously and fairly. 950 CMR 32.00 shall not limit the availability of other remedies provided by law.
- (2) The Division of Public Records is under the supervision of the Supervisor of Public Records. The Supervisor may amend and rescind such rules, forms and orders as are contemplated by the provisions of the Massachusetts General Laws and as are necessary to carry out their purposes.
- (3) The Supervisor of Public Records may authorize exceptions to 950 CMR 32.00 with respect to any specific requirement provided that such exceptions to 950 CMR 32.00 are in conformity with the provisions of the Massachusetts General Laws.

### 32.02: Definitions

For the purposes of 950 CMR 32.00 unless the context otherwise requires, the following terms shall have the meanings indicated:

<u>Advisory Opinion</u>. An opinion issued by the Supervisor of Public Records intended to provide guidance on issues related to public records access and retention.

Agency. Any agency, executive office, department, board, commission, bureau, division or authority of the commonwealth that is identified in M.G.L. c. 66, § 6A and c. 4, § 7, clause Twenty-sixth and makes or receives "public records", as defined in 950 CMR 32.02. Agency includes any person, corporation, association, partnership or other legal entity which receives or expends public funds for the payment or administration of pensions for any current or former employees of the commonwealth or any political subdivision as defined in M.G.L. c. 32, § 1.

<u>Business Day</u>. Monday through Friday. Business day does not include Saturdays, Sundays, legal holidays, or other weekdays where a custodian's office is closed unexpectedly.

Commercial Purpose. The sale or resale of any portion of the public record or the use of information from the public record to advance the requester's strategic business interests in a manner that the requester can reasonably expect to make a profit including in addition to the foregoing, obtaining names and addresses from the public record for the purpose of solicitation. It does not include gathering or reporting news or gathering information to promote citizen oversight or further the understanding of the operation or activities of government or for academic, scientific, journalistic, or public research or education.

<u>Custodian</u>. Any governmental entity that makes or receives public records.

<u>Division</u>. Division of Public Records, Office of the Secretary of the Commonwealth of Massachusetts.

Governmental Entity. Any agency or municipality as defined in 950 CMR 32.02. It includes any quasi-governmental agency that is considered a body politic and corporate or public instrumentality. It does not include the legislature and the judiciary.

<u>Municipality</u>. Cities and towns, local housing, redevelopment or similar authorities. A consortium, consolidation or combination of entities within a single political subdivision of the commonwealth or among multiple political subdivisions of the commonwealth shall be deemed a municipality.

<u>Public Record</u>. All books, papers, maps, photographs, recorded tapes, financial statements, statistical tabulations, or other documentary materials or data, regardless of physical form or characteristics, made or received by a governmental entity unless such materials or data fall within one or more of the exemptions found within M.G.L. c. 4, § 7, clause Twenty-sixth or other legally applicable privileges.

Records Access Officer. The employee designated within a governmental entity to perform duties described in 950 CMR 32.00 including coordinating a response to requests for access to public records, assisting individuals seeking public records in identifying the records requested, and preparing guidelines that enable requesters to make informed requests regarding the availability of such public records electronically or otherwise.

<u>Requester</u>. Any person or entity seeking to inspect or obtain copies of public records.

Redact. To delete, or otherwise expurgate that part of a public record that is exempt from disclosure under M.G.L. c. 4, § 7, clause Twenty-sixth or other legally applicable privileges from non-exempt material.

<u>Search Time</u>. The time needed to locate and identify, pull from the files, copy and reshelve or refile a public record. However, it shall not include the time expended to create the original record.

Secretary. The Secretary of the Commonwealth of Massachusetts.

Segregation Time. The time used to review records to determine what portions are subject to redaction or withholding under M.G.L. c. 4, § 7, clause Twenty-sixth or other legally applicable privileges. Segregation time shall not include time expended to review record for accuracy and correct errors.

<u>Supervisor</u>. Supervisor of Public Records or Supervisor of Records.

Withhold. To hold back from disclosure a record under M.G. L. c. 4, § 7, clause Twenty-sixth or other legally applicable privileges.

### 32.03: General Provisions

(1) <u>Division Mailing Address and Electronic Mail Address</u>. All communications shall be addressed or delivered to:

Supervisor of Records
Division of Public Records
Office of the Secretary of the Commonwealth
One Ashburton Place, Room 1719
Boston, Massachusetts 02108
or: pre@sec.state.ma.us

Electronic communication is strongly encouraged and is the preferred method of correspondence.

- (2) <u>Division Business Hours</u>. The regular hours of the Division are from 8:45 A.M. to 5:00 P.M. each business day.
- (3) <u>Computation of Time</u>. Unless otherwise provided, the computation of time referred to in 950 CMR 32.00 shall begin with the first business day following the date of receipt of any request, regardless of physical form. The computation of time for an oral request shall begin with the day the oral request was made to the custodian.

(4) <u>Presumptions</u>. In all proceedings pursuant to 950 CMR 32.00, there shall be a presumption that the record sought is public.

### 32.04: Records Access Officers

- (1) Each agency and municipality shall designate one or more employees as records access officer(s).
- (2) In a municipality, the municipal clerk, or the clerk's designees, or any designee of a municipality that the chief executive officer of the municipality may appoint, shall serve as records access officers.
- (3) The designation of a records access officer shall not be construed to prohibit employees who have been previously authorized by the agency or municipality to make public records or information available to the public from continuing to do so in accordance with 950 CMR 32.00.
- (4) Each agency and municipality shall post in a conspicuous location at its offices and on its website, if any, the name, title, business address, business telephone number, and business email address of each records access officer.
- (5) A records access officer shall:
  - (a) coordinate the custodian's response to requests for access to public records and shall facilitate the resolution of such requests by the timely and thorough production of public records;
  - (b) assist persons seeking public records to identify the records sought;
  - (c) assist the custodian in preserving public records in accordance with all applicable laws, rules, regulations and retention schedules;
  - (d) to the extent feasible, provide public records to a requester in electronic format unless the record is not available in electronic form or the requester does not have the ability to receive or access the records in electronic format and if feasible, in the requesters preferred format. In the absence of a preferred format, the records shall be provided in a searchable machine-readable form;

Where the requester is an individual held in custody in any correctional facility, as defined in M.G.L. c. 125, § l(d), the records access officer shall presume that the requester does not have the ability to receive or access records in usable electronic form;

(e) to the extent feasible, furnish the public records by providing

reasonable assistance in locating the records on an appropriately indexed and searchable public website;

- (f) prepare guidelines of the agency or municipality that enable the person seeking access to public records in the custody of the agency or municipality to make informed requests regarding the availability of such public records electronically or otherwise. The guidelines shall include a list of categories of public records maintained by the agency or municipality and such list shall be updated periodically; each agency or municipality that maintains a website shall post the guidelines on its website;
- (g) a municipal records access officer shall, to the extent feasible, post commonly available public record documents on a website maintained by the municipality. The website copy shall not be deemed the record copy for retention purposes.

### 32.05: Additional Records Access Officer Responsibilities

- (1) <u>Agency Records Access Officers</u>. The requirements of 950 CMR 32.05(1) shall apply only to agency records access officers.
  - (a) agency designation of primary and secondary records access officers; reporting requirements:
    - 1. each agency shall designate one primary records access officer responsible for reporting information to the Secretary pursuant to M.G.L. c. 66, § 6A(e) and 950 CMR 32.05(1)(c).
    - 2. a primary records access officer shall submit a notification of such designation to the Division electronically in a manner determined by the Division.
    - 3. the primary records access officer may notify the secondary record access officers to facilitate reporting such information.
    - 4. the primary records access officer shall electronically notify the Secretary of the designation of secondary records access officers electronically in a manner determined by the Division.
    - 5. the agency shall maintain and update information regarding primary and secondary records access

officers electronically, including changes in personnel identified as primary and secondary records access officers, in a manner determined by the Division.

- (b) agency records access officers shall electronically report to the Secretary the information described in 950 CMR 32.05(1)(c)1. through 9. in a manner determined by the Secretary.
- (c) an agency records access officer shall report to the Secretary with respect to written requests for public records and responses to these requests for each calendar year ending December 31<sup>st</sup>:
  - 1. the nature of each request and the date on which each request was received;
  - 2. the date on which a response is provided to the requester;
  - 3. the date on which a public record is provided to the requester;
  - 4. the number of hours required to fulfill the request;
  - 5. fees charged to the requester, if any;
  - 6. records access officer petitions to the Supervisor submitted under M.G.L. c. 66, § 10(d)(iv) and 950 CMR 32.06(4)(g) and (h);
  - 7. requests appealed to the Supervisor under M.G.L. c. 66, § 10A and 950 CMR 32.08(1);
  - 8. the time required to comply with the Supervisor's orders under M.G.L. c. 66, § 10A; and
  - 9. the final adjudication of any associated court proceedings under M.G.L. c. 66, § 10A(d).
- (d) the Supervisor may make exceptions to the reporting requirement in 950 CMR 32.05(1)(c) for particular classes of records, such as:
  - 1. certified copies of records;
  - 2. registry of deeds records;
  - 3. incorporation records;

- 4. vital records;
- 5. criminal offender record information requested by the offender, representative, or other authorized recipient.
- (e) all information must be provided in accordance with 950 CMR 32.05(1) within ten business days of the last day of the calendar year.
- (f) an agency shall provide on a searchable website electronic copies, accessible in a commonly available electronic format, of the following types of records, provided that any agency may withhold any record or portion thereof in accordance with state or federal law:
  - 1. final opinions, decisions, orders, or votes from agency proceedings;
  - 2. annual reports;
  - 3. notices of regulations proposed under M.G.L. c. 30A;
  - 4. notices of hearings;
  - 5. winning bids for public contracts;
  - 6. awards of federal, state and municipal government grants;
  - 7. minutes of open meetings;
  - 8. agency budgets; and
  - 9. any public record information of significant interest that the agency deems appropriate to post, such determination to be made by each agency on a case-by-case basis.
- (g) an agency shall post records online pursuant to 950 CMR 32.05(1)(f) as soon as practicable on a website maintained by the agency. The website copy shall not be deemed the record copy for retention purposes. 950 CMR 32.05(1)(f) and (g) shall apply only to records made or received on or after January 1, 2017.
- (h) an agency may fulfill the requirements of 950 CMR 32.05(1)(f) and (g) by providing links to other agency websites

that provide access to the categories of records described in 950 CMR 32.05(1)(f)1. through 9.; provided, however, that the website is searchable and provides electronic copies, accessible in a commonly available electronic format.

### 32.06: Rights of Access

- (1) Requests for Public Records.
  - (a) requests for public records may be made orally in person to a records access officer or custodian or may be written. Telephone requests may be accepted at the discretion of the records access officer.
  - (b) requests for public records shall include a reasonable description of the requested record to the records access officer so that he or she can identify and locate it promptly.
  - (c) written requests may be delivered by a requester to the business address or designated website or email address of a records access officer or custodian:
    - 1. by hand;
    - 2. by mail;
    - 3. by electronic mail; or
    - 4. by facsimile, if custodian has facsimile access.
  - (d) a records access officer shall not require a particular form be used by requesters, but may make forms available for requesters.
  - (e) a person shall not be required to make a personal inspection of the record prior to receiving a copy.
  - (f) calculation of time will commence only for requests that are made in accordance with 950 CMR 32.06(1).
  - (g) a request for records in which an individual, or representative of the individual has a unique right of access by statutory, regulatory, judicial or other applicable means, shall not be considered a request for public records.
- (2) Records Access Officer Response to Requests for Records.
  - (a) a records access officer or designee shall permit inspection

- or provide or furnish a copy of all public records within the custody and control of the custodian at reasonable times and without unreasonable delay under M.G.L. c. 66, § 10(a).
- (b) if applicable, a records access officer shall provide a written response under M.G.L. c. 66, § 10(b) to a request for public records no later than the tenth business day following the receipt of a request notwithstanding the applicability of any petition filed pursuant to 950 CMR 32.06(4).
- (c) a records access officer shall not charge a fee for the provision of a public record unless the records access officer responded to the requester within ten business days under M.G.L. c. 66, § 10(b).
- (d) if a records access officer intends to provide records, access to such records must be provided no later than the tenth business day following the receipt of a request, unless an extension of time is permitted in a manner consistent with 950 CMR 32.06(2)(i) and (4).
- (e) a written request for records, regardless of the form of delivery, will be deemed received on the first business day following receipt the request by the records access officer; an oral request will be deemed received on the day it was made.
- (f) a records access officer may delay provision of records until all fees related to such requests are paid in full by the person seeking access to the requested records in accordance with 950 CMR 32.07.
- (g) a records access officer shall, when appropriate, suggest a reasonable modification of the scope of the request or offer to assist the requester to modify the scope of the request if doing so would enable the agency or municipality to produce records sought more efficiently and affordably.
- (h) a records access officer may not require the requester to specify the purpose for a request except:
  - 1. when the requested records concern information which may be exempt from disclosure pursuant to M.G.L. c. 4, § 7(26)(n);
  - 2. to determine whether the records are requested for a commercial purpose; or

- 3. to determine whether to grant a request for a fee waiver.
- (i) a records access officer shall identify a reasonable timeframe in which it shall produce the public records sought in a manner consistent with M.G.L. c. 66, § 10(b)(vi), provided that the requester may voluntarily agree to a response date beyond these timeframes.

### (3) Denial by Records Access Officer.

- (a) a records access officer shall provide written notice by first class mail or electronic mail to a requester of any denial of access to records.
- (b) a records access officer shall provide such written notice of denial of access within ten business days of its receipt of a request for public records in accordance with 950 CMR 32.06(2)(b).
- (c) such written notice of denial shall include:
  - 1. the date of the request;
  - 2. identification of any records sought that are not within the possession, custody, or control of the agency or municipality the records access officer serves;
  - 3. identification of the agency or municipality that may be in possession, custody or control of the public record sought, if known to the records access officer;
  - 4. identification of any records, categories of records or portions of records that the agency or municipality intends to withhold;
  - 5. identification of any specific exemption to the Public Records Law or common law privilege that applies to the withhold record or records;
  - 6. identification of the applicability of each cited exemption or privilege to each portion of the withheld record or records;
  - 7. identification of any portions of responsive records that the agency or municipality intends to produce; and
  - 8. a statement informing the requester of the right of administrative appeal to the Supervisor under 950 CMR 32.08(1) and the right to seek judicial review of an unfavorable decision by commencing a civil action in the superior court.
  - (d) where a record has been withheld based on a claim of the attorney-

client privilege the records access officer shall provide in its written denial a detailed description of the record, including the names of the author and recipients, and in general terms, the subject matter of the withheld information.

# (4) <u>Petition for Modification or Waiver by a Records Access</u> <u>Officer to the Supervisor</u>.

- (a) petitions requesting an extension of time to furnish copies of the requested records or waive statutory limits to fees from a records access officer to the Supervisor shall be in writing and delivered to the Supervisor in accordance with 950 CMR 32.03(1). A copy of the petition shall be provided by the records access officer to the requester. The Supervisor shall issue a written determination with findings regarding any such petition within five business days following receipt of a records access officer petition.
- (b) petitions filed under 950 CMR 32.06(4) do not affect the requirement that a records access officer shall provide an initial response to a requester within ten business days after receipt of a request for public records, pursuant to 950 CMR 32.06(2)(a) or (b). Failure to comply with 950 CMR 32.06(4) will result in a waiver of the right to assess fees for public records.
- (c) all such petitions shall be considered public records both in the custody of the records access officer and the Supervisor.
- (d) petitions seeking an extension of time to furnish copies of the requested records must be made by a records access officer within 20 business days after receipt of a request for public records, or within ten business days after the records access officer's receipt of a determination by the Supervisor that a requested record constitutes a public record.
- (e) a petition for extension of time described in 950 CMR 32.06(4)(d) shall include a brief narrative detailing why an extension of time is necessary. Upon a showing of good cause, the Supervisor may grant a single extension. For an agency, such extension may not exceed 20 business days from the date of the grant of the extension by the Supervisor. For a municipality, such extension may not exceed 30 business days from the date of the grant of the extension by the Supervisor.
- (f) if, when reviewing a petition for extension of time

described in 950 CMR 32.06(4)(d), the Supervisor determines that the request is part of a series of contemporaneous requests that are frivolous or designed to intimidate or harass, and the requests are not intended for the broad dissemination of information to the public about actual or alleged government activity, the Supervisor may grant a longer extension or relieve the custodian of its obligation to provide copies of the records sought.

- (g) petitions seeking a waiver of statutory limits to fees assessed to segregate and/or redact public records must be made within ten business days after receipt of a request for public records.
- (h) a petition seeking a waiver of statutory limits to fees described in 950 CMR 32.06(4)(g) must be made in accordance with the following:
  - 1. any records access officer may petition the Supervisor to charge for time spent segregating or redacting records.
  - 2. only a municipal records access officer may petition the Supervisor for permission to charge fees in excess of the maximum hourly rate of \$25 per hour for time required to comply with a request.
  - 3. records access officers shall not petition the Supervisor seeking a waiver associated with the provisions of 950 CMR 32.07(2)(1)1. and (m)1.
  - 4. a records access officer shall respond to a request within five business days of receipt of the Supervisor's determination regarding a petition submitted under 950 CMR 32.06(4)(g).

### 32.07: Copies of Records; Fees

- (1) Copies of Paper and Electronic Records.
  - (a) upon request, a requester shall be entitled to receive in hand, by mail, by facsimile or electronically one copy of a public record or any desired portion of a public record.
  - (b) as an alternative to obtaining copies of records from a records access officer a requester shall be permitted, to the extent feasible, and at reasonable times:
    - 1. view and inspect records prior to obtaining copies; or

- 2. use a personal device such as a camera or portable scanner to copy records.
- (c) the records access officer shall presume that a requester prefers copies provided in machine-readable electronic form, when electronic form is available, unless the requester specifies an alternative preference.
- (d) the records access officer must provide electronic records in native form when possible.
- (e) when designing or acquiring an electronic record keeping system or database the records access officer in cooperation with the custodian shall ensure, to the extent feasible that:
  - 1. newly acquired or implemented electronic record keeping systems or databases are capable of providing data in a commonly available electronic, machine readable format; and
  - 2. the newly acquired or implemented electronic record keeping system allows for information storage and retrieval methods permitting retrieval of public portions of records to provide maximum public access.
- (f) furnishing a segregable portion of a public record shall not be deemed to be creation of a new record. This applies to a responsive record in the form of an extract of existing data, as such data exists at the time of the request and is segregable from nonresponsive and exempt data.

### (2) <u>Fees</u>.

- (a) a records access officer may assess a reasonable fee for the production of a public record except those records that are freely available for public inspection, subject to the provisions of 950 CMR 32.04(5)(d). A records access officer is encouraged to inform a requester of the availability of records online to avoid delays and fees associated with the provision of public records.
- (b) if fees are being assessed, a records access officer shall provide a written, itemized, good faith estimate of any fees that may be charged to produce the records prior to complying with a public records request within ten business days.

- (c) the reasonable fee for reproduction shall not exceed the actual cost of reproducing the record.
- (d) a fee shall not be assessed for time spent segregating or redacting records unless such segregation or redaction is required by law or approved by the Supervisor under 950 CMR 32.06(4)(g) and (h).
- (e) the charge for black and white paper copies or printouts of records of any size susceptible to ordinary means of production shall not exceed .05¢ per page, for both single and double-sided black and white copies or printouts.
- (f) a records access officer shall not assess a copying fee for electronic copies or copies of public records transmitted *via* facsimile.
- (g) the actual cost of any storage device or material provided to a person in response to a request for public records may be included as part of the fee.
- (h) for copies of public records not susceptible to ordinary means of reproduction, the actual cost incurred in providing a copy may be assessed.
- (i) a records access officer shall assess no fee greater than the lowest hourly rate of a person capable of compiling, segregating, redacting and reproducing a requested record, subject to the requirements of 950 CMR 32.07.
- (j) a records access officer may assess the actual cost of postage to mail copies of public records, provided:
  - 1. the requester specifically requests that records be mailed or is unable to receive copies in person; and
  - 2. the records access officer shall charge the lowest cost available for such mailings, at the discretion of the requester.
- (k) <u>Waiver of Fees</u>. Records access officers may waive or reduce the amount of any assessed fee upon a showing that:
  - 1. disclosure of a requested record is in the public interest;
  - 2. the request for records is not primarily in the

commercial interest of the requester; or

3. the requester lacks the financial ability to pay the full amount of the reasonable fee.

#### (l) Agency Records Access Officers.

- 1. an agency records access officer shall not assess a fee for the first four hours of time spent searching for, compiling, segregating, redacting and reproducing a requested record.
- 2. an agency records access officer shall not assess a fee for time spent segregating and redacting a requested record unless such segregation or redaction is required by law or approved by the Supervisor under 950 CMR 32.06(4)(g) and (h).
- 3. an agency records access officer shall assess no fee of more than \$25 per hour for the cost to comply with a request for public records.

### (m) Municipal Records Access Officers.

- 1. a municipal records access officer shall not assess a fee for the first two hours of time spent searching for, compiling, segregating, redacting and reproducing a requested record in a municipality with a population of over 20,000.
- 2. a municipal records access officer in a municipality with a population of 20,000 persons or fewer may assess a fee for the first two hours of time spent compiling, segregating, redacting and reproducing a requested record, provided:
  - i. population data shall be determined by the decennial U.S. Census; and
  - ii. it shall be the burden of the municipal records access officer to provide population data information in responses in which it seeks to assess such fees.
- 3. a municipal records access officer shall assess no fee of more than \$25 per hour for the cost to comply with a request for public records unless approved by the Supervisor under 950 CMR 32.06(4)(g) and (h).

- 4. a municipal records access officer shall not assess a fee for time spent segregating and redacting a requested record unless such segregation or redaction is required by law or approved by the Supervisor under 950 CMR 32.06(4)(g) and (h).
- (n) <u>Failure to Pay Fee</u>. A records access officer may provide written notice denying access to public records to a requester who has failed to compensate the custodian for previously produced public records, provided:
  - 1. a fee estimate for a previous request was prepared in compliance with 950 CMR 32.00 and the requester agreed to pay the previous fee;
  - 2. the written notice details the reasons for denial, including an itemized list of any balances attributed to previously produced records.

#### 32.08: Appeals

### (1) Appeal to the Supervisor.

- (a) 950 CMR 32.08 shall not apply to records in which an individual, or a representative of the individual, has a unique right of access to the record through statutory, regulatory, judicial or other applicable means.
- (b) a requester may petition the Supervisor for failure by a records access officer to comply with a requirement of 950 CMR 32.00.
- (c) an oral request, while valid as a public record request, shall not be the basis of an appeal under 950 CMR 32.08.
- (d) petitions for appeal of a response by a records access officer must be made within 90 calendar days of the date of the response by a records access officer.
- (e) petitions for appeal of a failure to respond within the timeliness requirements of 950 CMR 32.00 must be made within 90 calendar days of the request.
- (f) all petitions for appeal shall be in writing and shall specifically describe the nature of the requester's objections to the response or failure to timely respond.

- (g) requesters shall provide to the Supervisor complete copies of all correspondence associated with the petition, including:
  - 1. a complete copy of the letter by which the request was made, including in the case of electronic communications all header information indicating time, date, subject, sender and recipient email addresses; and
  - 2. a complete copy of all written responses associated with requests subject to the petition for appeal, including in the case of electronic communications all header information indicating time, date, subject, sender and recipient email addresses.
  - (h) in petitioning the Supervisor, the requester shall provide a copy of such petition to the records access officer associated with such petition.
  - (i) if the requester's petition for appeal is related to a previous appeal to the Supervisor, the requester's petition shall refer to the previous appeal number.
  - (j) petitions under 950 CMR 32.08 received before 4:00 P.M. shall be opened on the day of receipt. Petitions received after 4:00 PM shall be opened on the following business day.

# (2) <u>Dispositions of Appeals</u>.

- (a) the Supervisor shall issue a written determination regarding any petition submitted in accordance with 950 CMR 32.08(1) not later than ten business days following receipt of the petition.
- (b) the Supervisor may deny an appeal for, among other reasons if, in the opinion of the Supervisor:
  - 1. the public records in question are the subjects of disputes in active litigation, administrative hearings or mediation;
  - 2. the request is designed or intended to harass, intimidate, or assist in the commission of a crime;
  - 3. the public records request is made solely for a commercial purpose;

- 4. the requester has failed to comply with the provisions of 950 CMR 32.08(2).
- (c) upon a determination by the Supervisor that a violation has occurred, the Supervisor shall order timely and appropriate relief.

### (3) Hearings and Conferences.

- (a) the Supervisor may conduct a hearing pursuant to the provisions of 801 CMR 1.00: *Standard Adjudicatory Rules of Practice and Procedure*. The decision to hold a hearing shall be solely in the discretion of the Supervisor.
  - 1. said rules shall govern the conduct and procedure of all hearings conducted pursuant to 950 CMR 32.08.
  - 2. nothing in 950 CMR 32.08 shall limit the Supervisor from employing any administrative means available to resolve summarily any appeal arising under 950 CMR 32.00.
- (b) the Supervisor may order conferences for the purpose of clarifying and simplifying issues and otherwise facilitating or expediting the investigation or proceeding. The decision to hold a conference shall be solely in the discretion of the Supervisor.

## (4) In Camera Inspections and Submissions of Data.

- (a) the Supervisor may require an inspection of the requested record(s) in camera during any investigation or any proceeding initiated pursuant to 950 CMR 32.08.
- (b) the Supervisor may require the records access officer to produce other records and information necessary to reach a determination pursuant to 950 CMR 32.08.
- (c) the Supervisor does not maintain custody of documents received from a records access officer submitted for an in camera review. The documents submitted for an in camera review do not fall within the definition of public records. M.G.L. c. 4, § 7(26).
- (d) upon a determination of the public record status of the documents, they are promptly returned to the custodian, and no copies shall be retained by the Supervisor.
- (e) any public record request made to the Division for records being reviewed in camera would necessarily be denied, as the office would not be the custodian of those records.

- (f) attorney-client privileged records voluntarily submitted to Supervisor:
  - 1. a records access officer may voluntarily submit documents to the Supervisor for in camera review;
  - 2. such submission shall not waive any legally applicable privileges claimed by the agency or municipality.

#### (5) Custodial Indexing of Records.

- (a) the Supervisor may require a records access officer or custodian to compile an index of the requested records within the context of a public records appeal under 950 CMR 32.08.
- (b) said index shall be a public record and shall meet the following requirements:
  - 1. the index shall be contained in one document, complete in itself;
  - 2. the index shall adequately describe each withheld record or redaction from a released record;
  - 3. the index must state the exemption or exemptions claimed for each withheld record or each redaction of a record; and
  - 4. the descriptions of the withheld material and the exemption or exemptions claimed for the withheld material must be sufficiently specific to permit the Supervisor to make a reasoned judgment as to whether the material is exempt.
- (c) nothing in 950 CMR 32.08 shall preclude the Supervisor from employing alternative or supplemental procedures to meet the particular circumstances of each appeal.

#### 32.09: Enforcement of Orders

A records access officer shall promptly take such steps as may be necessary to comply with an order of the Supervisor. If a records access officer fails to comply with an order issued by the Supervisor, the Supervisor, upon the Supervisor's initiative, may notify the Attorney General to ensure compliance.

## 32.10: Advisory Opinions

Advisory opinions from the Supervisor may be requested. However, it shall be in the Supervisor's discretion whether to issue an advisory opinion. The Supervisor has and will continue to provide a staff member on call every day during regular business hours to offer informal information to any person, whether a requester or custodian.

### REGULATORY AUTHORITY

950 CMR 32.00: M.G.L. c. 66, § 1.

#### 74 • A Guide to the Massachusetts Public Records Law

### **Examples of Exemption (a) Statutes**

Abatement Applications: G. L. c. 59, § 60.

Address Confidentiality Program: G. L. c. 9A, § 6.

Affordable Housing Applicant Information: G. L. c. 40T, § 3.

Air Pollution Control (Trade Secrets): G. L. c. 111, § 142B.

Alcohol Treatment Records: G. L. c. 111B, § 11.

Bank Examination Records: G. L. c. 167, § 2.

Bid Information, Trade Contractor Scores: G. L. c. 149A, § 8(f).

Birth Reports: G. L. c. 46, § 4A.

Blind Persons, Commission for the Blind Register: G. L. c. 6, § 149.

Business Schools (Private), Financial Statements: G. L. c. 75D, § 3.

Capital Facility Construction Project Records: G. L. c. 30, § 39R.

Central Registry of Voters: G. L. c. 51, § 47C.

Conflict of Interest, Request for an Opinion: G. L. c. 268A, § 22.

Consumer Protection Investigation: G. L. c. 93A, § 6(6).

Councils on Aging, Names, Addresses and Telephone Numbers of Elderly: G. L. c. 40, § 8B.

Criminal Offender Record Information: G. L. c. 6, § 167.

Delinquency, Sealing by Commissioner of Probation: G. L. c. 276, § 100B.

Department of Social Services, Central Registry: G. L. c. 119, § 51F.

Department of Youth Services Records: G. L. c. 120, § 21.

Drug Addiction Treatment Records: G. L. c. 111E, § 18.

Employment Agencies, Data: G. L. c. 140, § 46R.

Employment Security Data: G. L. c. 151A, § 46.

Exemption of Legislature from Public Records Law: G. L. c. 66, § 18.

Evaluations of Special Needs Children: G. L. c. 71B, § 3.

Fetal Death Reports: G. L. c. 111, § 202.

Firearms Bureau Records: G. L. c. 66, § 10(d).

Gas and Electric Affiliated Company Records: G. L. c. 164, § 85.

Genetically Linked Diseases, Testing Records: G. L. c. 76, § 15B.

Hazardous Substances Reports: G. L. c. 111F, § 21.

Hazardous Waste Management Records: G. L. c. 21D, § 6.

Hazardous Waste Facilities: G. L. c. 21C, § 12.

Historical and Archaeological Sites and Specimen Inventory: G. L. c. 9, § 26A (1).

Home Addresses and Telephone Numbers of Public Safety Personnel, Victims of Adjudicated Crimes and Persons Providing Family Planning Services: G. L. c. 66, § 10.

Hospital Records: G. L. c. 111, § 70.

Hospitals, Reports of Staff Privilege Revocation: G. L. c. 111, § 53B.

Impounded Birth Records: G. L. c. 46, § 2A.

Inspector General Investigations, Records: G. L. c. 12A, § 13.

Juvenile Delinquency Case Records: G. L. c. 119, § 60A.

Library Circulation Records: G. L. c. 78, § 7.

Malignant Disease Reports: G. L. c. 111, § 111B.

Massachusetts Commission Against Discrimination Investigatory Files: G. L. c. 151B, § 5.

Massachusetts Technology Development Corporation, Corporate Records: G. L. c. 40G, § 10.

Mental Health Facilities Records: G. L. c. 123, § 36.

76 • A Guide to the Massachusetts Public Records Law

Merit Rating Plans, Motor Vehicle Insurance: G. L. c. 6, § 183.

Mortgage Lender and Mortgage Broker Examination Records: G.L. c. 255E, § 8.

Mortgage Loan Originator Examination Records: G.L. c. 255F, § 14(d).

Native American Burial Site Records: G. L. c. 9, § 26A (5).

Natural Heritage Programs, Data Base: G. L. c. 66, § 17D.

Open Meeting Law: G. L. c. 30A, §§ 18-25.

Patient Abuse Information; Intermediate Care Facilities for Mentally Retarded Citizens, Convalescent, Nursing or Rest Homes: G. L. c. 111, § 72I.

Patient's Rights to Confidentiality of Records; Medical and Mental Health Facilities: G. L. c. 111, § 70E.

Protective Services Records, Aged Persons: G. L. c. 19A, § 23.

Public Assistance Records, Aged Persons, Dependent Children, Handicapped Persons: G. L. c. 66, § 17A.

Public Assistance, Wage Reporting System Information: G. L. c. 62E, § 8.

Rape Reports: G. L. c. 41, § 97D.

Reyes Syndrome Report: G. L. c. 111, § 110B.

Sex Offender Registry, Requests for Registry Information: G. L. c. 6, § 178I.

Street Lists, Children Aged 3-17, Court Order Granting Protection: G. L. c. 51, § 4(a), (d).

Student Records: G. L. c. 71, § 34D, 34E.

Tax Returns: G. L. c. 62C, § 21.

Venereal Disease Records: G. L. c. 111, § 119.

Vocational Rehabilitation Records: G. L. c. 6, § 84.



William Francis Galvin
Secretary of the Commonwealth
Division of Public Records
One Ashburton Place, Room 1719
Boston, MA 02108